

ANNUAL REPORT OF THE ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION TO THE ANN ARBOR CITY COUNCIL FOR THE CALENDAR YEAR 2014

In accordance with the bylaws of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission, an annual report is to be prepared by staff, approved by the Commission, and presented to City Council each year outlining the activities of the Historic District Commission for the previous year.

Annual Retreat

A Historic District Commissioner retreat was held March 25, 2014. The retreat agenda included review and discussion of:

- □ Refresher on Standards and Guidelines.
- Review of last year's projects.
- Review of the HDC bylaws.

Statistics

A total of 266 applications were received by the Commission in 2014. This is up 24% from the 215 applications received in 2013.

The Historic District Commission has delegated a number of minor activities to staff to approve on their behalf, and 203 of the 266 (or 76%) of the applications submitted for staff approval received staff Certificates of Appropriateness. Generally speaking, these are routine work activities that do not affect historic materials on a structure, like replacing a non-historic roof with the same. Other examples of some of the thirty-six kinds of work that may be approved by staff, if the work is appropriate, include:

- □ Replacement of non-original windows, doors, or garage doors
- Installation of external lighting on signs
- Reconstruction of existing porches
- New or replacement fences
- Replacement of walkways
- Installation of skylights on non-character defining roofs
- □ Installation of solar panels on non-character defining roofs
- Installation of windows and doors in new openings on non-contributing buildings
- Installation of new residential patios located at the rear of the building
- Installation of new metal chimneys that do not compromise architectural roof features

The Commission held hearings on the other 63 applications during their regular monthly meetings. Of those applications, 54 (or 86%) received Certificates of Appropriateness and five applications (or 8%) were denied. Four (4) applications (6%) were partially approved and partially denied, with a determination that some portion of the application did not meet the HDC's standards and guidelines, while other work proposed by the applications received Certificates of Appropriateness. All of the sites were visited prior to their hearing by the HDC Review Committee, which is made up of two Commissioners and staff.

The denied applications included:

- □ A request to replace repairable wood windows.
- □ A new store front with an incompatible design and materials.
- An inappropriately large addition.
- □ The replacement of wood deck boards with an artificial material.

Historic Preservation Awards

Each year, the Historic District Commission presents Historic Preservation Awards to property owners who have shown dedication to preservation by rehabilitating or maintaining their historic property. The Ann Arbor Historic District Commission's 2014 awards were presented during the June 16, 2014 City Council meeting. A reception for award recipients was held at the Judge Robert S. Wilson House at 126 N Division Street following the ceremony at City Hall.

For More Information

If you would like more information about the Historic District Commission or its activities, please contact Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator, at (734) 794-6265 x42608 or email thacher@a2gov.org.

30th Annual Ann Arbor Preservation Awards

June 16, 2014

























Rehabilitation Awards

Presented in recognition of substantial work that returned a property to a state of utility through repair or alteration, facilitating contemporary needs but respecting the features of the property that are significant to its historic and architectural values.



University of Michigan: East Quad

The University spent \$116 million to renovate the red-brick East Quad Dormitory (built in 1940) into a state-of-the-art and richly appointed residence. The design is contemporary and sleek but incorporates the building's historical architectural elements. East Quad had the entire slate roof replaced, the leaded glass in the windows restored, the window glazing on the upper floors replaced, and the exterior walls restored. Two historic lounges on the main floor had their wood paneling and fireplaces repaired.



University of Michigan: Munger Residences

The \$39 million renovation of the Gothic Lawyers Club Building (built in two stages between 1923 and 1933—one along State Street and the other along South University) was accomplished with a donation of \$20 million by Charles T. Munger. As a result, the Lawyers' Club Residences were renamed the Charles T. Munger Residences.

The renovation addressed infrastructure needs including plumbing, heating, air-conditioning, ventilation, fire detection, fire suppression, wired and wireless systems, and accessibility issues.

The slate roof was replaced so that many original pieces of slate were left in situ. The exterior masonry was repaired, joints were re-pointed, and existing windows stayed in place. They also managed to fit in two new elevators without compromising the historical integrity of the building.

The Detroit firm SmithGroup and the Washington, DC group Hartman-Cox Architects were in charge of the renovations.

Presented in recognition of superior maintenance of a significant property to preserve its essential historical, cultural or architectural value for a period of 10 years or more.



Susan and Martin Hurwitz: 1520 Cambridge

This center-entry Colonial Revival yellow brick house with red tile roof was built in 1913 for Professor Max Winkler and his wife Clemence. Winkler was a U-M Professor of German since 1890 and later head of the German Department. He was one of the first Jewish professors hired by the University and in his will (he died in 1930) left over \$100,000 for scholarships for Jewish students.

Note the round topped windows, the classical surround of pilasters and broken pediment, and the prominent modillions. One interesting factoid: Winkler and neighbor Louis Strauss had the street named changed to Cambridge from Israel Street, which they felt suited a college town better (to compete with Oxford Street).

Following the Winklers, the house was owned by Judge Henry T. Conlin and his wife. When they prepared to sell the house to a fraternity in 1980, a group of neighbors organized in opposition and the leader of the group—Donna Richter later Donna Tope—was successful in keeping it a single family home.

Since 1991 Susan and Martin Hurwitz have done amazing things to keep this house in wonderful condition and have invested heavily in its upkeep and preservation.



Kappa Alpha Theta (Eta Chapter):

1414 Washtenaw

This Colonial Revival house with its two-story columns and row of dormers is actually a remodeling of an 1867 house built by Dr. Silas Pratt and later owned by other professors. When the sorority purchased it in 1916, they had U-M Professor of Architecture Louis H. Boynton completely remodel it inside and out. Pewabic tiles grace fireplaces inside and the interior is colonial in feel with butternut woodwork in the living room. Boynton, a native of Connecticut, studied at MIT, lived in Rome for two years, and worked at the best architectural firms in Boston and New York, including McKim, Mead and White, before coming to Ann Arbor in 1912.

Kappa Alpha Theta was the first Greek-letter sorority established at the U-M in 1879 and was one of the first Greek letter organizations to locate on Washtenaw. The sorority applied to the State of Michigan for Historic Designation in 1982 which they received in 1983. They have maintained the house in beautiful condition ever since.



First Presbyterian Church: 1432 Washtenaw

This Gothic Revival Church in the English Country style was designed by the New York City architects Mayers, Murray and Phillip who were the successors to Bertram Goodhue, known for building in a medieval style. This firm also designed Christ Church Cranbrook in 1928 and Christ Church Grosse Pointe in 1930. The Presbyterians had worshipped at the corner of Huron and Division since the 1830s and moving to Washtenaw was entering another world.

It is an L-shaped building with the sanctuary facing Washtenaw and wings on the sides for students and social activities. Two expansions have occurred since. The original church has lancet windows with stained glass, many buttresses and a steep slate roof. Leading up to the main entry are a beautiful stand of mature trees, remnants of the "picnic grove" that surrounded the home of U-M English Professor Isaac Demmon which occupied this site earlier. Today, this little bit of England rests comfortably amidst the sororities and fraternities, making Washtenaw a very special avenue.

3



Ann Arbor City Club: 1830 Washtenaw

In May of 1888, the *Ann Arbor Courier* announced that "Evart Scott is busy as a bee excavating for his new home at Elm Fruit Farm on Washtenaw." Scott's fairly plain farmhouse was later purchased in 1917 by Dr. R. Bishop Canfield, a professor at the U-M Medical School, and remodeled by Louis H. Boynton (see 1414 Washtenaw) into a Colonial Revival home. A Then and Now article by Grace Shackman in the *Ann Arbor Observer* from June 1989 was titled "The Three Lives of 1830 Washtenaw" and that is certainly the case.

The Ann Arbor Women's City Club, after considering the Earhart Mansion on Geddes Road, bought this house in 1951 and remodeled it as a clubhouse. Eleven years later they hired U-M Professor of Architecture Ralph Hammett to design an addition on the south. In 2008 the club was opened to both men and women and the name changed accordingly to The City Club. They have done an outstanding job of maintaining the integrity of the house, its additions, its deep setback, and the site for over 50 years. They add to the specialness of Washtenaw. Although the volunteer leadership of the City Club has continually changed throughout the past 63 years, the club's members have always taken seriously their role as stewards of the historic home and maintained it with



Ken Wisniski and Linda Dintenfass: 13 Regent Drive

This was home designed by local architect David Osler in 1964 for William and Margaret Mundus. It sits by a steep ravine overlooking the Arboretum and was a challenge to Osler. It is constructed in his own special version of Mid-Century Modern with five levels to accommodate the terrain. Most of the house is hidden from public view, a conceit of many of Osler's houses and those of his inspiration Frank Lloyd Wright.

After the Mundus family moved next door in 1977, new owners redid the kitchen and family room. In 2012, Stan Monroe was hired by our winners Ken Wisniski and Linda Dintenfass to change the third level for a master bedroom and rebuild the five decks, one of which was structural. He kept the feeling of the original design at the owners' request. Now the bedroom looks into the Arb. At a recent open house, Osler blessed this new bedroom and thought it a mighty fine renovation of his work.



Howard Shapiro: 7 Regent Drive

The house was designed for Joe Morris by Alden Dow of Midland in 1964. Still a stickler for details, Dow fit the house perfectly on its site with three levels and views into the Arb. It has a flat roof with flared edges on the west and resembles three boxes with a hidden entry.

Dow designed only three houses in Michigan: one for his sister Margaret Towsley at 1000 Berkshire, this house (because Morris was a colleague of Dr. Towsley, Margaret's husband), and one for Dr. Sidney Toobler on Belmont. This house also shows influences of Frank Lloyd Wright, with whom Dow studied at Taliesin in the 1920s. It retains its integrity today on a picturesque parcel of land and remains true to its 1965 origin.

Dr. Shapiro has lovingly cared for the house, furnishing it with period antiques and opening it for tours.



Margaret Bignall and Paul Hossler: 1448 Broadway

This tiny 1½ story wooden Greek Revival side-gabled house (950 square feet) was typical of the houses of our settlers in the early 19th century. A picture in earlier times appears in Sam Sturgis' *Old Ann Arbor Town* and shows a man with a bicycle and a more elaborate structure with shutters, gingerbread along the eaves and a fancy portico with elaborate columns.

It was built by John Lennon in 1852 when he purchased the property from Absalom Traver for \$75. Minerva Flint purchased it in 1852 for \$250. The property was later in the hands of Alonzo Gratton (1873), Catherine Bull (Buell, 1885), and Claramon Pray (1891). She was there until WWI and then the house changed hands often.

Since 1980, it has been in the caring hands of the current owners Margaret Bignall and Paul Hossler who have maintained this tiny piece of the past along with its ancient barn.



Carol and Robert Mull:

1111 Fair Oaks

This landmark building in the Ives Woods/Burns Park neighborhood makes a dramatic statement at the corner of Fair Oaks and Norway with its two-story, half round pillared portico. It was built as a nod to Monticello and the White House—examples of the classical styles enjoying a revival at the time. It fronts a house with an irregular floor plan, with round rooms in the center and rectangular rooms on the sides. This can be a challenge for a family raising three children.

The house was built in 1916 and designed by U-M Professor of Architecture Fiske Kimball (who went on to great fame as the director of the Philadelphia Museum of Art) for James N. and Clara Petrie. It was part of a development known as Scottwood developed by Charles Spooner. The name "Scottwood" reflected the fact that the land was the former farm of Evart Scott (see 1830 Washtenaw).

Carol and Bob Mull have lovingly kept this house in pristine condition since 1979 which brings great beauty and stability to the neighborhood.



Stone School Cooperative Nursery: 2811 Stone School Road

Constructed in 1911, this school is one of the most picturesque rural schoolhouses left in Michigan. It is one story with a high attic and is of fieldstone—thus giving its name to the road. This building replaced an 1853 schoolhouse originally for Pittsfield Township children and incorporates some of the materials from the original building.

In 1949 it was boarded up when a new school was built. Countless people seeing the charming school unused sought to buy it but it remained empty until 1955 when a nursery school opened due to the efforts of parents led by Millie Seltzer. It remains a nursery school today and sports its original foundation stone and a school bell and belfry. It was purchased by the Stone School Cooperative from the Ann Arbor School system in 1995 and they received state historic preservation funds to restore it. They also had it listed on the National Register of Historic Places that same year.



John Hollowell: 844 W. Huron

This Old West Side landmark Gothic Revival house at the busy intersection of Huron and Seventh is the fine work of William H. Mallory who built it in 1872. The elaborate details, fine carpentry and complicated design reflect his profession as a builder and carpenter and also his ownership of a wood planing mill that specialized in sashes, shutters, doors, and gingerbread. There are two porches, two bay windows and eared trim with elaborate scroll details. A twin of this house is kitty korner from here.

The house was a rental for most of its history and was neglected until the 1970s when John Hollowell bought and restored it. Large Victorian lamp posts from the 1890s were moved to the site from Belle Isle in Detroit. John Hollowell has continued its history as a rental, which provides a cash flow to preserve and maintain the building. He has maintained it in great condition.



Steve Sivak: 1158 Pomona

This wonderful example of a midcentury modern house was built in 1955 for Joseph and Emma Albano. Joseph was an architect who was hired in 1947 by the U-M School of Architecture. Born in Chicago, he'd studied with Mies van der Rohe and attended IIT—one of the premier schools teaching modernism at the time.

The long, low lines of this house with prominent carport, exposed rafters, vertical cedar siding, and flat roofs are features of the style. Also important are the large expanses of window glass on the sides, with a blank façade offering privacy from the street.

Albano retired in 1971 and they stayed until 1975. Steve Sivak has maintained it in wonderful condition since 1995.



Akhavan Rayhaneh: 2022 Delafield

Another great example of a midcentury modern house is found on the Northside of town. This house was designed by James P. Wong in 1959 (though the city directory says "under construction" in 1960). Wong is a local architect and past president of the Huron Valley chapter of the American Institute of Architects (in 1984). Wong was also active in church groups helping build public housing in Ann Arbor, as well as a practicing architect, in the late 1960s.

It was built for Richard Hadden, the Assistant Director of U-M Press. The Rosenberg family lived here from 1966-69 and they refer to it as a "bonnet" house because of the steeply pitched gables in the front. Floor to ceiling windows form part of the façade while the overhang has exposed rafters which add a dramatic touch.

Akhavan Rayhaneh has owned it since 1989 and maintained it in wonderful condition.

Special Merit Awards

Presented in recognition of exceptional people, projects, landscapes or other unique preservation projects.



Susan C. Wineberg and Patrick M. McCauley: Authors of "Historic Ann Arbor: An Architectural Guide"

Local historians Susan C. Wineberg and Patrick M. McCauley have completed a new book on Ann Arbor's historic buildings. The book, *Historic Ann Arbor: An Architectural Guide*, describes over 350 buildings including forty University of Michigan buildings.

This was a labor of love for Ms. Wineberg and Mr. McCauley, it is an achievement of Herculean proportions. The duo spent four years researching, documenting, photographing, and writing this book. It will be a valuable resource to anyone who is interested in the architecture or history of Ann Arbor.

We wish to recognize their effort and express appreciation for this enormous contribution of recording the city's buildings and history.

Preservationist of the Year

Presented to an individual who has provided the City of Ann Arbor with exemplary services in the pursuit of historic preservation, incentives, and/or education.



Ethel K. Potts: 2014 Preservationist of the Year

Growing up outside of Chicago, Ethel K. Potts' early memories are of the wonderful buildings and streetscapes of that city. In high school, she wrote a paper on the great architects of the time. When she came to Ann Arbor to attend the University of Michigan, she experienced that same appreciation for Ann Arbor's historic buildings. She was fascinated with the architects practicing in Ann Arbor at the time, such luminaries as Brigham, Johe, Metcalf, and Albano. It was not long before she became part of the town—and never left.

Ms. Potts has served numerous times on the City's Zoning Board of Appeals and the Planning Commission. During that time, she has always been an enthusiastic advocate for historic preservation, and mentored future preservationists. She is an outstanding public servant. "This city means a lot to me, its buildings and history must be maintained for generations to come," says Ms. Potts.

We recognize, honor, and thank Ms. Potts for her commitment to historic preservation in the City of Ann Arbor.