

FINAL REPORT
PROPOSED FOURTH AND FIFTH AVENUE HISTORIC DISTRICT STUDY

Fourth and Fifth Avenue Historic District Study Committee

Adopted MAY 17, 2010

CHARGE OF THE HISTORIC DISTRICT STUDY COMMITTEE

Pursuant Chapter 103, Section 8:408 of Ann Arbor City Code, the Fourth and Fifth Avenue Historic District Study Committee (“Study Committee”) was established by the Ann Arbor City Council to evaluate a residential area just south of downtown Ann Arbor to determine if it meets the criteria for historic district designation. The Study Committee was established by Council vote on August 17, 2009 and members were appointed on September 8, 2009. The Study Committee was given until September 2010 to complete its work and make its recommendation to City Council in the form of this report. The City Council also passed a resolution establishing a six-month moratorium on building permits in the proposed historic district was to expire on February 6, 2010. A six-month extension of the moratorium was passed by City Council on February 1, 2010, extending it until August 6, 2010.

STUDY COMMITTEE MEMBERS

Patrick McCauley, Chair, is a graduate of the University of Michigan with a BA in History. He has worked on older and historic homes for over 20 years with his family's painting business. He has restored three houses on his own since 2001, and won a Rehabilitation Award from the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission in 2007 for the rehabilitation of his 1845 Greek Revival-style house.

Kristi Gilbert, Vice Chair, is a ten year resident of the Old West Side. She has a Master’s degree in Historic Preservation from Eastern Michigan University and previously served on the city’s Independent Historic Properties Historic District Study Committee. She is a member of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission’s Annual Awards Committee and serves on the Michigan Historic Preservation Network’s Historic Resources Council Committee.

Ina Hanel-Gerdenich is an architectural historian and preservation planner. She obtained her Master’s of Science degree in historic preservation from Eastern Michigan University and is a preservation consultant. Her clients have included local units of government, institutions of higher education, non-profit organizations and private property owners. To date she has served on four historic district study committees in the local area and has rehabilitated two houses. She has also served on the board of directors of the Washtenaw County Historical Society, the Kempf House Center for Local History, and the Michigan Barn Preservation Network.

Rebecca Lopez Kriss is a Masters Candidate at the Gerald R. Ford School of Public Policy at the University of Michigan. She currently sits on the board of the Ann Arbor Area Chamber of Commerce

and volunteers in various capacities throughout the city. The 4th and 5th Avenue Historic District Committee is her first experience with preservation; she enjoys research, training and education.

Sarah Wallace is an Ann Arbor native and received her Master's degree in Historic Preservation Planning from the University of Pennsylvania in 2006. She has served on the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission since the summer of 2007, and is currently chair.

Tom Whitaker is a resident of the Germantown neighborhood where he lives with his family in a restored home. He has a Bachelor's degree in construction management and a Master's degree in historic preservation from Eastern Michigan University, as well as a graduate certificate in real estate development from the University of Michigan. He formerly worked for the Christman Company, where he helped manage the restoration of the University of Notre Dame's Main Administration Building. He also managed construction projects for U of M, including historic restorations of Hill Auditorium and the Rackham School of Graduate Studies. Previously, he served on the West Area Plan Steering Committee for the City of Ann Arbor.

Susan Wineberg is a historic preservationist with a degree from Eastern Michigan University. She has served on the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission three times, served as President of the Washtenaw County Historical Society for five years, and continues to serve as Chair of the Awards Committee of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission. She has also served on and chaired many local historic district study committees. She lives in an 1850 Greek Revival-style house in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District.

The study committee was assisted in its work by Jill Thacher, AICP, City Planner with the City of Ann Arbor and Kristine Kidorf of Kidorf Preservation Consulting.

DESCRIPTION OF THE DISTRICT

The proposed historic district is shown on the attached district map. It is generally bounded by South Fourth and Fifth Avenues, running approximately one block beginning just south of William Street to and including both sides of Packard Street on the south edge of downtown Ann Arbor. The topography is primarily flat, with a slight slope downward toward Packard Street. South of Packard Street there is a steep hill. The district is an urban neighborhood, with concrete sidewalks and tree lawns containing a mix of newer and mature trees on both sides of the streets. South Fifth Avenue is two lanes wide for one-way, southbound traffic and a bike lane, and South Fourth Avenue and Packard Street are two lanes wide with two-way traffic. The north-south alley to the west of Fourth Avenue is one lane wide and has several garages adjacent to it. It is one of the few alleys in the downtown area that remains partially residential in character.

There are forty-six residential buildings and one church in the district. The houses have varying front yard setbacks, but all generally have shallow front yards with smaller side yards. The houses on the southwest corners of South Fourth and Fifth Avenues where Packard intersects have larger, irregularly shaped lots due to Packard Street's angular alignment. Those houses fronting South Fourth and Fifth Avenues face east and west, while those located on Packard Street face north and south.

The houses in the district vary in size and architectural style. There are small, one-and-a-half story and two-story Greek Revival-style houses and two-and-a-half story Queen Anne houses, many with vernacular detailing. There are a few Italianate-style and several Arts and Crafts-style houses. The majority (89%) of the houses are sided with clapboard, some of which has been covered with artificial siding. The remaining houses include structures of brick and stucco. Eleven of the houses have older garages, including one that is attached to a barn. The Church in the proposed district is a large stone Gothic Revival structure with several additions.

There are a number of landscape features in the district. The majority of properties have mature trees in the front and/or rear yards, including those planted in a pattern at 120 Packard and an old one at the rear between 314 and 308 Packard Street. Seven properties have mature lilac bushes in the front and/or side or rear yards. The historic fencing in the district consists of a wrought iron fence shared by two properties and one example of a wood frame fence with a middle section of metal chicken wire. The latter is unique in that it includes one section topped with old wrought iron cresting. Both fence types have associated gates.

INVENTORY

Portions of the proposed district were surveyed as part of larger formal and informal “windshield” surveys by the city of Ann Arbor in 1973, 1975, 1976, 1978, 1982, 1988 and 1990. These surveys consist only of a photo inventory and covered many different areas of the city. The inventories do not have associated survey reports and do not make evaluations or conclusions about potential historic properties or districts. The surveys do not contain any historic research and were of little value to the Committee’s work. Copies of all the survey data are located at the City of Ann Arbor in the offices of the Community Services Area, Planning and Development Services Unit.

An intensive-level survey accompanied with a photographic inventory was conducted of the study area by the study committee (Attachment A). Copies of these survey forms and photographs are also on file at the City of Ann Arbor in the offices of the Community Services Area, Planning and Development Services Unit. The Study Committee relied on the primary and secondary historical information listed in the bibliography of this document in researching the history of the proposed district and in making the conclusions of this report.

EVALUATION OF THE DISTRICT INTEGRITY AND HISTORIC VS. NON-HISTORIC RESOURCES

Per *National Register Bulletin 15*, the definition of a historic resource is a “Building, site, district, object, or structure evaluated as historically significant.” Further it states, “a district possesses a significant concentration, linkage, or continuity of sites, buildings, structures, or objects united historically or aesthetically by plan or physical development.”

National Register Bulletin 15 also discusses integrity. “For a district to retain integrity as a whole, the majority of the components that make up the district’s historic character must possess integrity even if they are individually undistinguished. In addition, the relationships among the district’s components must be substantially unchanged since the period of significance.” In the case of the proposed district, the majority of the buildings, features and objects contribute to the district, they have not been moved from their

original location, retain their historic setting, and the district still conveys the sense of a historic environment.

The properties within the district were evaluated by the committee as to whether they were historic (contributing) or non-historic (non-contributing) using criteria established by the National Register of Historic Places (Secretary of the Interior, 36 CFR Part 60), as dictated by the city's Historic Preservation Ordinance (Chapter 103 of the Ann Arbor City Code) and *Local Historic Districts in Michigan* by the State Historic Preservation Office:

- 1) A resource must have been built during the period of significance and typically be at least 50 years old (although not applicable for the proposed district, in some instances resources of a lesser age may qualify if they have exceptional significance);
- 2) The resource must maintain some integrity of design, setting, location, materials, workmanship, and feeling;
- 3) A resource must possess a particular architectural style (form and associated decorative details) or reflect a particular time of construction (form with sufficient decorative details to indicate that period in time);
- 4) A resource must be in overall good condition and intact; and
- 5) The resource must contribute to one or more of the historic contexts identified in the proposed district. These contexts include architecture, German ethnic heritage, and settlement history (associated with aspects of Ann Arbor and University of Michigan development).

All but one of the primary and secondary buildings listed above have been determined as contributing to the historic fabric of the proposed district. None of the buildings were moved after 1941 and retain their historic setting and location. All of the contributing resources were developed during the period of significance (and hence at least fifty years ago) and contribute to the 19th and early 20th century residential nature of the district. Seventy-two percent (72%) of the properties maintain a high level of integrity (see list below). Essential physical features are the overall form and architectural features on the resources dating to the period of significance and they remain intact and visible in the district. Twenty-eight (28%) of the properties within the proposed district portray a moderate level of integrity. These properties continue to portray their original character despite some alterations, many of which are potentially reversible. These include buildings covered by artificial siding and/or with replacement doors or windows within their original openings. All of the resources are in sufficiently good condition, and there is sufficient documentation (as recorded on the survey forms) to show all contribute to one or more of the historic contexts. Specifically, forty-seven (47%) contribute to architecture and another 26%, while not exemplary of a specific architectural style, are excellent examples of construction characteristics of their time when compared to similar-aged properties in the City of Ann Arbor. Archival research to date using reference material listed in the Bibliography section of this report indicates that at least 40% of the resources are directly associated with members of the German community that played a significant role in Ann Arbor's evolution as a city. Sixty-two (62%) have sufficient documentation to show that they were the homes of residents who played a role in the city's commerce (including the University of Michigan) and politics.

The properties with a high level of integrity include:

- On South Fifth Ave.: 407, 411, 415, 419, 427, 438, 441, 444, 445, 450, 504, 509;
- On South Fourth Ave.: 408, 417, 423, 430, 432, 434, 441, 442, 445, 451;
- On East Jefferson St.: 300;
- On Packard St.: 120, 126, 209, 214, 216, 226, 228, 305, 306-08.

Those properties with a moderate level of integrity include:

- On South Fifth Ave.: 416, 433, 437, 506, 507, 515;
- On South Fourth Ave.: 414, 426;
- On Packard Street: 200, 215, 219, 220, 314.

Not included in the above evaluation due to lack of extant infrastructure are four parcels in the proposed district that are vacant and are associated with the Bethlehem Church property. Three contiguous ones are situated along South Fifth Avenue east behind the church and currently serve as a parking lot and playground. They were purchased by the church for this purpose between 1963 and 1965. Similarly, a fourth vacant lot south of the church and its property at 437 South Fourth serves as the entry drive to the parking lot. Another property not included in the above evaluation is located on the west side of South Fourth Avenue. It is owned by Detroit Edison and contains an electric substation constructed in the 1970s. It is listed as a non-contributing resource in the property list above.¹

COUNT OF HISTORIC AND NON-HISTORIC RESOURCES

There are a total of forty-seven primary and fourteen secondary buildings, one structure, and thirty-five objects in the district. Eighty-nine percent of the ninety-nine resources contribute to the district. There are 60 contributing buildings and 1 non-contributing building. There are 26 contributing objects and 9 non-contributing objects, including landscape features and a parking lot. There is 1 non-contributing structure. The resources in the district are listed below by address. The resources that contribute to the district do so because they date to the period of historic significance and maintain a sufficient level of historic integrity. An analysis of this evaluation follows the list of resources.

LIST OF RESOURCES

HISTORIC (CONTRIBUTING) RESOURCES

407 South Fifth Avenue – 1902 – Bannister House, lilacs back yard

411 South Fifth Avenue – 1901 – Andrew Reule House

415 South Fifth Avenue – 1838, 1859 – Gaskell-Beakes House, 1 tree in tree lawn

416 South Fifth Avenue – c. 1860 – Zebedee Waldron House, 1 tree in tree lawn

419 South Fifth Avenue – 1902 – Henry Mann House

427 South Fifth Avenue – c. 1896 – Francis M. Hamilton House

¹ The parking lot associated with the Muehlig Funeral home is not part of the proposed historic district.

433 South Fifth Avenue – 1850s-1880s – Sidney Clarkson/Herbert Slauson House, 2 garages, trees in front and side yards

437 South Fifth Avenue – 1866 – John McCarthy House, tree in front yard

438 South Fifth Avenue – 1925 – Erwin Schmid House, 1 garage, wrought iron fence and gate, 2 trees in rear yard

441 South Fifth Avenue – 1908 – Christeena Bross House

444 South Fifth Avenue – 1905 – Erwin Schmid House, 1 garage, wrought iron fence and gate

445 South Fifth Avenue – 1890 – Frank J. Lewis House, 1 garage

450 South Fifth Avenue – c. 1850 – Uri Bassett House

500 South Fifth Avenue – 1894 – Emmanuel Wagner House

504 South Fifth Avenue – 1911 – Herman Stierle House, barn

506 South Fifth Avenue - 1888 - Alfred T. Bruegel House

507 South Fifth Avenue – c. 1886, 1913 move/remodel – unknown, 1 garage

509 South Fifth Avenue – 1927-28 – Thomas Corbett House, 1 garage

515 South Fifth Avenue – 1874-78 – George Haller House, 1 garage (1924), 1 tree in front yard

408 South Fourth Avenue – 1902 – Karl Guthe House, 1 garage (1931-48), hitching post

414 South Fourth Avenue – c. 1920 – Sophia Allmendinger House, south lot line trees

417 South Fourth Avenue – 1903 – Jonathon Stanger House

423 South Fourth Avenue – 1896, 1933 – Bethlehem Evangelical Church

426 South Fourth Avenue – 1861-63 - Jacob A. Polhemus House, lilacs in front yard, cluster of trees at north lot line

430 South Fourth Avenue – c. 1860 – Rose Cummings House

432 South Fourth Avenue – 1924 – Bethlehem Evangelical Church Parsonage, 1 garage, lilacs rear yard

434 South Fourth Avenue – 1916 – Emil Calman House, 1 tree in tree lawn

436 South Fourth Avenue – 1916 – Frank Bolich House

437 South Fourth Avenue – c. 1915 – John and Fredericka Mayer House

442 South Fourth Avenue – 1894 – Gottlieb Wild House, 1 garage, wood and wrought iron fence/gate, 1 tree in side yard

445 South Fourth Avenue – 1890 – George and Emma Wahr House (garage non-contributing)

451 South Fourth Avenue – 1850s-80s – Wines/Kerr House, 1 tree in front yard

300 East Jefferson Street – 1899-1901 – Daniel and Nancy White House

120 Packard Street – 1848 – William W. Wines/Dean House, 1 garage, lilacs and trees in front yard

126 Packard Street – c. 1880s – Dr. Samuel A. Jones House

200 Packard Street – c. 1865 – Edward Briggs House

209 Packard Street – c. 1910 – unknown

214 Packard Street – c. 1883 – Charles Wagner House, 1 tree in front yard adjacent to house

215 Packard Street – 1880-83 – Catherine Mogk House, 1 barn with garage addition, 1 tree in front yard (evergreen)

216 Packard Street – 1819 – Griffith Cossar House

219 Packard Street – 1853-66 – Cole House (1894)

220 Packard Street – c. 1860 – Johnson House

226 Packard Street – c. 1905 (moved) – unknown
228 Packard Street – c. 1905 – Gustav Sodt House
305 Packard Street – 1915 – Barker House
306-08 Packard Street – c. 1890 – Reinhardt House, lilacs NW corner, 1 tree in west yard
314 Packard Street – 1894 – Walter C. Mack House, 1 tree in rear yard

NON-HISTORIC (NON-CONTRIBUTING) RESOURCES

420-430 S. Fifth Avenue – parking lot – c. 1965
438 S. Fifth Avenue – metal posts at front door – c. 1960
506 S. Fifth Avenue – wood post and single chain fence – c. 1980
418 S. Fourth Avenue – Detroit Edison Substation - c. 1970
438 S. Fourth Avenue – gazebo, stone structure in rear yard
445 S. Fourth Avenue – garage, wrought iron fence and gate – c. 1950
451 S. Fourth Avenue – wrought iron fence – c. 1950
126 Packard – wood post and single chain fence – c. 1980
200 Packard – chain link fence – c. 1960

BOUNDARY DESCRIPTION

The district is generally bounded by the east and west sides of South Fourth and Fifth Avenues south of William Street to and including the south side of Packard Street, more specifically described as:

Beginning at a point sixty feet north of the south lot line of Lot 15, Block 4 South, Range 4 East of the Original Plat of Ann Arbor; then west approximately 130 feet to the west line of the alley running north and south between South Main Street and South Fourth Avenue; then south along said west line to the NW corner of that portion of Lot 18 lying southwest of Packard Street, Block 5 South, Range 4 East of the Ann Arbor Land Company's Addition; then continuing South to the SW corner of Lot 15, Block 5 South, Range 4 East of the Ann Arbor Land Company's Addition; then East 66 feet; then North 80 feet; then East 66 feet; then Southeast approximately 80 feet across South Fourth Avenue to a point 26.5 feet north of southwest corner of Lot 2, Block 5 South, Range 5 East of the Ann Arbor Land Company's Addition; then east 47.5 feet; then south 43 feet; then east approximately 130 feet to the east line of Lot 4, Block 5 South, Range 5 East of the Ann Arbor Land Company's Addition; then South 49.5 feet; then East approximately 130 feet to the northeast corner of Lot 11, Block 5 South, Range 5 East of the Ann Arbor Land Company's Addition; then Southeast approximately 65 feet to the intersection of the east line of South Fifth Avenue and the southwest line of Packard Street; then South on the east line of South Fifth Avenue 95.5 feet; then deflecting 79 degrees, 50 minutes left for 67 feet; then deflecting right 73 degrees for 33.1 feet; then southeasterly to the east line of Lot 14, Block 5 South, Range 6 East of the Ann Arbor Land Company's Addition; then North 61 feet to the southwest line of Packard Street; then continuing North to the centerline of Packard Street, then northwesterly to the east line of Lot 2, Block 5 South, Range 6 East of the Ann Arbor Land Company's Addition; then North to the south line of Lot 1,

Block 5 South, Range 6 East of the Ann Arbor Land Company's Addition; then east to the southeast corner of Lot 1, Block 5 South, Range 6 East of the Ann Arbor Land Company's Addition; then North 66 feet; then West 84 feet; then North 66 feet to the south line of East Jefferson Street; then continuing North across Jefferson Street to the north line of East Jefferson Street; then East 37 feet; then North 56 feet; then East 5 feet; then North 34 feet; then East 42 feet; then North 42 feet; then East 16.5 feet; then North 132 feet; then West 16.5 feet; then North 66 feet; then East 16.5 feet; then North 132 feet; then West 148.5 feet to the east line of South Fifth Avenue; then continuing West to the west line of South Fifth Avenue; then South approximately 88 feet to the northeast corner of Lot 13, Block 4 South, Range 5 East of the Original Plat of Ann Arbor; then West to the centerline of South Fourth Avenue; then North to the Point of the Beginning.

BOUNDARY JUSTIFICATION

The starting point for the proposed district boundaries were defined by the Ann Arbor City Council in its resolution dated August 17, 2009. The southern boundary of the study area has been modified to include properties on the south side of Packard Street. The properties on Packard contribute to the historic character of the district, and include an important pioneer house at 120 Packard that was previously recognized by the city as an individual historic property.

The district is bounded on the north by the William Street Historic District. The eastern boundary is defined on the north end by the rear lot lines of the properties along the east side of South Fifth Avenue. Behind these properties is an early twentieth-century development that bisected Block 4 South, Range 6 East, of the original plat of Ann Arbor. This development, created by Francis Hamilton, included a new street called Hamilton Place, and featured densely-packed vernacular houses on smaller-than-average-sized lots. While the houses on Hamilton Place were constructed during the period of significance, they represent only one small phase of the period and generally share a common vernacular architectural style. This is distinct from the district itself which includes intact resources that span almost the entire period of significance, and which represent a variety of architectural styles. This area was not studied by the committee. The eastern boundary line is extended to Packard Street by continuing to follow the rear lot lines of the houses along the east side of South Fifth Avenue, and includes 305 Packard Street. Next to 305 Packard to the east, there is a modern apartment building.

The area to the east and the one beyond the southern boundary of the district are marked by residential areas illustrating contextual themes separate from those of the proposed district. Both of these areas contain some residential buildings that were constructed at the same time as in the proposed district; however neither area was so densely developed as early as the proposed district. South of the Packard Street properties the land begins to slope steeply, a geographic separation from the proposed district. As in the area to the east of the district, the area to the south includes houses of architectural interest, particularly along South Fifth Avenue. Many of these properties are associated with working class families whose neighborhood revolved around several factories and a lumber yard in the low land along East Madison Street. The historical association with higher style architecture and civic leaders is not as strong in this neighborhood as in the proposed district. The western boundary of the proposed district is

defined by modern commercial buildings along Main Street, which are not congruous with the history or architecture of the proposed district.

HISTORY OF THE DISTRICT

Early Settlement and the Development of a Residential Neighborhood, 1824-1851

The history of the district parallels and is connected to that of the city of Ann Arbor as a whole, both chronologically and thematically. Most of the area was part of the original plat of “Ann Arbour,” recorded by city founders John Allen and Elisha Walker Rumsey in Detroit in 1824. The plat consisted of rows of mostly rectangular blocks, each block with an alley running along the length of the middle of the block.² Variations to this format existed for the parcels around the center public square (to the north of the neighborhood) and other selected parcels, particularly those along the eastern boundary. The latter includes those properties along the east side of South Fifth Avenue in the study area, which formed the southeast corner of the original plat. These lots were drawn larger than the remaining ones within the village.

The village of Ann Arbor grew quickly from fifty people in 1824 to over four hundred people just three years later when it became the Washtenaw County seat. By 1833 the village was incorporated by the territory legislature, electing founder John Allen as its first village president. In 1837, at the same time that Michigan became a state, the University of Michigan moved from Detroit to Ann Arbor because of availability of land, namely forty acres donated free of charge to the State of Michigan for the University by the Ann Arbor Land Company. This land was to the east of the study area. The Michigan Central Railroad arrived two years later providing a passenger and freight link to Detroit and the nation beyond for both the village and surrounding farms. During this time, the direction of building in Ann Arbor extended north and south from John Allen’s block house (today’s 101 North Main Street) along Main Street and east and west along Huron Street. It soon extended along Fourth and Fifth avenues, as well as along Ashley Street (formerly Second Street) and Packard Street.³ In 1851, Ann Arbor was incorporated as a city by the state legislature and proclaimed itself the “most desirable residence in the Great West.”

By this time the Fourth and Fifth Avenue district was part of a rapidly developing residential neighborhood situated on the south side of downtown. The earliest plat map indicating infrastructure and dated 1853 depicts the neighborhood, consisting of houses with varying footprints, outbuildings, and lot sizes that extended approximately from Packard Street north to Liberty Street, and from Main Street east to Fifth Avenue, with a few additional houses on the north side of East Jefferson Street, west side of Main Street and south of Packard on Fourth and Fifth Avenues. The northern boundary was defined by the commercial buildings creeping south along Main Street, and by the former jail site between South Fourth and Fifth Avenues on East Liberty Street. Within the study area, the 1853 map depicts houses on many, although not all, of the properties along South Fourth and Fifth Avenues and

² Plat of Ann Arbor, 1824.

³ O. W. Stephenson, Ph.D., *Ann Arbor: The First Hundred Years*, 1927 (433).

spilling over the original village plat boundaries onto Packard Street. Several of the larger platted properties along the east side of South Fifth Avenue were already themselves divided into smaller parcels. Accompanying outbuildings (generally small barns and carriage houses) are shown at the rear of some of the properties, particularly those along the western side of South Fourth Avenue. These outbuildings were accessed *via* the alley cutting through the center of the block. Today this alley remains as one of the few residential alleys to survive in the downtown area.

The earliest extant houses in the district were constructed during the period from the 1830s through the 1850s and were associated with some of the earlier settler families of Ann Arbor. Examples of these include:

- 415 South Fifth Ave (1838 Gaskell-Beakes House)
- 120 Packard Street (1848 William Wines House)
- 450 South Fifth Ave (c. 1850 Bassett-Ditz House)

The Gaskell-Beakes house at 415 South Fifth Avenue was constructed about 1838 by Clayton Gaskell. For most of the second half of the 19th century, the house was the home of Hiram Beakes (1827-1882), an attorney from New York who arrived in Ann Arbor in 1851. It was Beakes who added a substantial addition on the south side of the home in 1859. The William Wines house at 120 Packard Street was constructed in 1848, most likely by William's brother, Daniel Wines. Daniel was a builder by trade, and according to Chapman (1881), "erected many of the best business houses and private residences in Ann Arbor."⁴ His profession and that of his brother, as well as the short-term ownership of 451 South Fourth Avenue by both men suggests that one or the other may have had a hand in the construction of the older portion of that structure. William Wines was the operator of a lumber mill in Ypsilanti, and the founder of Wines and Worden clothing business. The Wines family arrived in Washtenaw County in 1837. Uri Bassett, who purchased the land now known as 450 South Fifth Avenue for \$100 in 1849, was a teacher and directed the Old Academy formerly located at the northwest corner of Fourth and William. He sold the property in 1856 for \$500, suggesting that the diminutive Bassett-Dietz house was built by this time. A structure on the site is depicted on the 1853 map of Ann Arbor. A slightly later one-story addition wraps around the original 1.5-story structure on its north side.

Ethnic Settlement in the District, 1850s to post-1960s

The village of Ann Arbor continued to expand during the mid-19th century, driven by the local economy and the arrival of new settlers. The economy was primarily based on providing services, storage, and supplies to the surrounding farms, as well as on real estate and legal services commonly associated with a county seat. Additional residents came in part because of the economy, but also because the State of Michigan actively recruited immigrants from Europe, and in particular, Germany. The first German family to move to Ann Arbor was that of Jonathan Henry Mann, who arrived in 1830 after a short stay in Pennsylvania. The family originally emigrated from the Kingdom of Wuerttemberg in southern Germany. Over the next century, they and then their relatives, friends, and descendants were

⁴ Chapman (1881): 1061.

instrumental in assisting the State by recruiting German relatives and friends to the Ann Arbor area. These Germans came in a continuous stream beginning in the 1830s and 1840s, some settling in Ann Arbor, and others moving out to the surrounding farms within the County. The German community became so dominant in the 19th and early 20th centuries that they were able to maintain their own culture and language and not assimilate into the surrounding English culture until the time of the World Wars. In 1880 the census showed that one out of every nine residents of Ann Arbor was German-born. By this time Ann Arbor had a German newspaper, three German churches, a German Workingman's Association, a German shooting club, a German Athletic Society, two German choirs, a German Coronet band and a large German-owned park.⁵ German families rose to become business leaders and were among the area's most prominent residents. Their names included Eberbach, Hutzel, Staebler, Mack, Schmid, Luick, Herz, Wagner, Haller, Haarer, Koch, Wurster, Muehlig, Schumacher, Weinmann, Goetz, Bach, Fischer, Schlenker, George, Mann, Fritz, Walz and many others. Although the majority of Germans lived west of Main Street in what is now called the Old West Side, some early and prominent families resided in the proposed district east of Main Street, particularly after the Civil War and up to World War II. These families included the Allmendinger, Goetz, Haller, Mann, Reichart, Schmid, Stampfler, Wagner, Walz, and Wild families, among others. Representatives of the Muehlig, Eberbach, and Allmendinger families are associated with properties in the William Street Historic District, immediately north of the district.

In general, research for this report suggests that the Germans settled within the study area and area to the south beginning in the mid-1850s. The 1856 city plat map indicates the name of A. Wideman as a property owner between Fourth Avenue and Main Street on the south side of Packard. The Dietz House at 450 South Fifth Avenue mentioned above was purchased by a German family around 1860. A grandson of Jonathan Henry Mann by the name of Friedrich Schmid, Jr., built his house at 438 South Fifth Avenue sometime before 1874 when it is depicted in the *Combination Atlas Map of Washtenaw County, Michigan*.⁶

By the end of the Civil War, the neighborhood was fully developed. A bird's eye view map published in 1866 depicts houses on most parcels along South Fourth and South Fifth Avenues, and along both sides of Packard Street. The blocks to the south of Packard and east of Fifth Avenue were only partially developed. A closer view of a surveyor's map dated 1870 indicates that all but two lots have been developed in the proposed district. The greater residential neighborhood still extended west to South Main Street and north towards East Liberty Street. The area to the east of the neighborhood continued to be less densely populated, and the area south of Packard Street was developed in the areas nearer to the top of the hill.

An analysis of the construction dates and architectural styles of the houses within the proposed district indicates that German families started building homes there during the 1870s and continued well into the 1920s. The peak decades of construction were during the 1890s and 1900s, when Germans built over half of the homes attributed to them. They adopted the styles and construction techniques

⁵ Jonathan Marwil, *A History of Ann Arbor*, 1987, (61).

⁶ *Combination Atlas Map of Washtenaw County, Michigan*, Everts and Stewart, Chicago, Illinois, 1874.

popular during their time, favoring Queen Anne-style architecture during the 1890s and kit houses during the 1900s.

Some of the German families within the neighborhood attended the Bethlehem Evangelical Church, the largest physical evidence of the German presence in the proposed district. The church was central to German identity, which was reinforced later with the establishment of Muehlig Funeral Home in the old Jacobs mansion at Fourth and William (William Street Historic District) in 1928. The Bethlehem congregation had previously been part of the first German-speaking Lutheran congregation founded by Pastor Friederich Schmid. After establishing the Bethlehem Church, Schmid went on to organize over 20 additional German Lutheran churches in southern and central Michigan. In Ann Arbor, the church occupied its own building at the northeast corner of West Washington and South First Streets. In 1875 Pastor Schmid and some congregation members from the Bethlehem Church split off to form the Zion Lutheran Church. A couple of decades later, the remaining Bethlehem Congregation under the leadership of Pastor John Neumann hired Detroit architect Richard Rasemann to design a new building. The new location was to be in a prosperous residential area, following a similar pattern established by most other churches in town. The site selected was on South Fourth Avenue, adjacent to a parsonage the congregation had built in 1877. The new building was built in the Richardsonian Romanesque style with Gothic features and constructed of native fieldstone. The building was completed in 1895 with the dedication in January, 1896. A parish hall was constructed as an addition to the church in 1932-1933 in a similar style to that of the church. It was designed by either Thomas S. Tanner or Ralph W. Hammett (historic sources differ on which one) and replaced the original parsonage on the site. The congregation also provided a German speaking school in the late 1800s through the first decade of the 1900s. The school became bilingual in 1906 and was located on South First Street in the Old West Side.

The Bethlehem congregation eventually owned two other houses standing in the district. The house at 432 South Fourth, constructed in 1924, served as a parsonage, housing the Reverends Gustav Neumann (1924-1928), Theo Schmale (1928-1947), and Walter Press (1947-1955). It was sold in 1955. The house at 437 South Fourth Avenue was constructed by John and Fredericka Mayer in the 1910s and they lived there until 1929 when it was deeded to the church. It served as the home of the caretaker. The church still owns the property today.

In addition to the church, 45% of the existing homes in the district were built and/or occupied by those of German descent (although not all attended the Bethlehem church). They include the following (names and approximate dates of tenure given in parentheses):

- 411 South Fifth (Andrew Reule, 1901-1940)
- 419 South Fifth (Henry and Mary Mann, 1902-c. 1920)
- 438 South Fifth (Frederick Schmid, Jr. and family, from before 1874 to 1917 [older home]; son Erwin Schmid and family, 1917-2002 [older and present home])
- 444 South Fifth (Erwin Schmid and family, 1905-1917; William Walz and descendants, 1917-2008)
- 450 South Fifth (Jacob Ditz family and descendants, c. 1860-1960s)

- 500 South Fifth (Emanuel Wagner, 1894-1960s)
- 504 South Fifth (Herman and Amanda Stierle, 1911–1960s)
- 506 South Fifth (Alber T. Bruegel, 1888-1920s)
- 515 South Fifth (George Haller, 1875–1914)
- 408 South Fourth (Karl Guthe, UM Physics professor, 1902)
- 414 South Fourth (Klais, before 1890-1909 [older home], Glitzenhirn-Allmendinger-Baur, 1923-1959 [present home])
- 417 South Fourth (Jonathan Stanger, 1903-1940s)
- 432 South Fourth (Bethlehem Church parsonage, 1924-1955)
- 436 South Fourth (Charles Nissle, 1920-after 1952)
- 437 South Fourth (John and Fredericka Mayer, 1917-1929; Bethlehem Church, 1929-present)
- 442 South Fourth (Wild Family, 1894-1988)
- 445 South Fourth (George and Emma Wahr and Schaffer family, 1890-1970s)
- 200 Packard St (Jacob Wahl and family, 1905-1920s)
- 214 Packard St (Charles Wagner, 1883-after 1898)
- 228 Packard St (Gustav Sodt, 1910-after 1920)
- 306-08 Packard St (Reinhardt Family, owner and occupants of parcel and area by 1868-until after 1915)
- 314 Packard St (Mack Family, 1894-c. 1910)

Other houses were not built by Germans, but were occupied by them. These include 507 South Fifth (Charles Feldkamp Family from 1915 to 1936) and 209 Packard Street (members of the Mann family lived here from 1920-after 1945).

Architectural Styles in the District

In addition to the German settlers building homes, others were also building homes in the district. During the late 19th century and into the 20th century, the district reinvented itself as a newer residential area, with older houses moved, rearranged, or demolished, to make room for newer houses built by German and non-German property owners alike. Thus, the architectural styles found in the Fourth and Fifth Avenue Historic District represent the progression of styles popular during the period beginning from the earliest days of settlement through the 1920s. Beginning in the 1830s settlers in the area brought their architectural traditions from the eastern United States, where the Greek Revival style of architecture was dominant. The style was one of the first popular Romantic styles in the areas of the United States being settled from about 1830 to 1850. It tends to mimic classical Greek temple fronts, with gabled or hipped roofs with a low pitch, a cornice band with wide trim, front doors surrounded by narrow sidelights and a transom above the door. The district contains a number of outstanding

examples of the Greek Revival style, including 426 South Fourth Avenue; 415, 433, 437, and 450 South Fifth Avenue and 120 Packard (which also exhibits Italianate-style detailing added later).

The district also contains a number of buildings constructed in styles associated with the Victorian period. Popular from the 1860s through the 1900s, these styles include Italianate, Queen Anne, and Richardsonian Romanesque. The Queen Anne style in particular was popular to construct because of the plentiful supply of lumber in Michigan and the growing number of mills able to produce standard size lumber, including 2x4's and decorative elements. Ann Arbor had mills that produced brackets, cut shingles, doors, molding, and ornamentation that were located in the area now known as Kerrytown. A lumber yard was also situated just south of the district beginning at this time. The profession of architecture was growing, and pattern books were available to show how to build these houses. The economic conditions were also such that construction of these homes was very affordable for the average, middle class family. Examples of the Queen Anne style can be found at 417, 442 and 445 South Fourth Avenue, 419 and 445 South Fifth Avenue, 300 East Jefferson Street and 306 Packard Street.

The Italianate style with its cube-like massing, lower pitched roofs, brackets and round arch top and Palladian windows is also represented in the district. The Italianate style was more likely to be expressed as a box with a hip roof accompanied by decorative wood trim (including brackets under the eaves), and porches. Two houses in the district feature this style: 430 South Fourth Avenue and 507 South Fifth Avenue.

Made popular in the late 1800s by Boston architect Henry Hobson Richardson, the Richardsonian Romanesque style was most popular for civic building such as city halls and post offices, as well as religious structures. Richardson's designs of the Allegheny Courthouse and Jail in Pittsburgh, and Trinity Church in Boston were noted for the use of heavy masonry and large Roman arches for openings. There is one example of Richardsonian Romanesque in the district. It is the Bethlehem Church at 423 South Fourth Street, which was designed by Detroit architect Richard Rasemann. An anchor building visible throughout the neighborhood, the church was constructed with native fieldstone walls, stone trim, and a slate roof. Although patterned after Richardson's designs, the architect also incorporated Gothic details, making the building a combination of Richardsonian Romanesque and Gothic Revival styles. Another example of this style in Ann Arbor is the former Michigan Central Railroad Depot (now the Gandy Dancer restaurant).

The turn of the 20th century brought more variety in the architecture of the neighborhood. The Colonial Revival style became one of the most popular styles throughout the United States, developing from an interest in all things colonial after the nation's Centennial celebration in 1876. The house at 228 Packard is an example of the style with Doric porch columns and cornice returns. The district also has two Dutch Colonial Revival examples, a common variation of the style. These are found at 441 and 500 South Fifth Avenue, the latter being constructed of brick.

Although the Colonial Revival style continues well into the 20th century, other styles begin to appear such as Arts and Crafts bungalows and Four Squares, and the English Revival or Neo-Tudor styles. Defined by the wide overhanging eaves, exposed rafter tails, large porches, and wood trim, the styles

were developed in reaction to the increasing number of mass manufactured goods. Examples of the Arts and Crafts Style in the district are found at 226 Packard, at 434, 436, and 437 South Fourth Avenue, a set of twin houses. Architect Herman Pipp designed the example at 438 South Fifth Avenue.

As noted above, the designs of two architects are represented in the district: Richard Rasemann and Herman Pipp. Richard Rasemann (b. 1885) was a German-born architect educated in part at a German-American Seminary. He came to Detroit and went into practice from 1851 to 1891 with Swiss-born Julius Hess. In addition to designing Bethlehem Evangelical Church in the district, he designed a number of prominent Detroit buildings including the Harmonie Club (1894); the Hinz Building (1908); and the Hemmeter Building (1911).

Herman Pipp (1868-1945) was born in Brighton, Michigan and learned the architectural trade from his father, William Pipp. He came to Ann Arbor in 1891 after the death of his father. His brother Henry Pipp was a contractor who was also trained by the father, and who came to Ann Arbor in 1892. Herman Pipp's offices were located at 118 West Washington in Ann Arbor. He designed the former Ann Arbor City Hall (1907), the Nickels Arcade (1916), and the office building for Hoover Ball & Bearing Company. He worked with Detroit architect George Mason on the Princess Hotel in Toronto, Ontario. He also designed a number remodeling projects including converting a roller-skating rink into the Majestic Theater (1907), renovating the Athens Theater (1907), and remodeling the German-American Savings Bank into a women's store for Charles Hutzel (1916). Also in 1916 Pipp designed the Alpha Chi Omega house (called a fraternity, but it was actually a women's Greek organization) at Olivia and Cambridge. In Barton Hills he designed houses for the Olifphants and the Underdowns, as well as the golf course and country club building. Pipp designed the Marchese Block, located at 319 S. Main, (now the Whitker Building) an outstanding art deco building that was built in 1925, just one year after the Erwin Schmid house at 438 S. Fifth Avenue (in the district).

Sources differ on whether the 1933 addition to the Bethlehem Evangelical Church was designed by Thomas S. Tanner or Ralph Hammett. Tanner was an Ann Arbor architect with his own firm from 1927-1962 when he partnered with Henry Kowalewski. He received his Masters of Architecture from the University of Michigan and was an associate professor there. In Ann Arbor he designed residences for Robert S. McNamara and Arjay Miller as well as the FCV office building. He also designed the Adrian Michigan Civic Auditorium and Gymnasium and a factory in Manchester, Michigan. Ralph Hammett was also a professor at the University of Michigan and held a master's degree from Harvard University. His Ann Arbor designs include an addition to the First Congregational Church, the St. Andres Episcopal Church chapel and parish hall and the Lutheran Student Chapel and Center.

During the second half of the 19th century, as the German population in the neighborhood increased, until the first decades of the 20th century, much construction took place within the neighborhood. Houses were modified, such as the Gaskell-Beakes and Bassett-Ditz Houses described above. Other houses were replaced by larger and more fashionable houses of the late 19th century as well as by more economical possible kit houses of the early 20th century. These include most of the houses identified in this report. Later, changes to the landscape included replacing barns and carriage houses with one and two-car vernacular garages as automobiles became more prevalent. The one exception in the

neighborhood is the barn located at 215 Packard Street, which was modified and added onto to accommodate cars instead of being replaced. Landscape features, such as the wrought iron fence at 438-444 South Fifth Avenue, relatively old lilac bushes scattered throughout the district and mature trees also remain from the late 19th and early 20th century period.

Commerce and the University of Michigan

Many of the houses in the neighborhood served as homes to merchants and their employees, and other professions of the middle to upper-middle class families. For example, Mr. William Wines (120 Packard Street) was the operator of a lumber mill in Ypsilanti, and the founder of Wines and Worden clothing business. In the 1870s his house was sold to Nelson Strong, another Ann Arbor pioneer who sold it to his son-in-law Sedgewick Dean, a grocer. In 1902 Dean was one of the founders of the Argo Milling Company and built the Argo Power house in 1903. He also owned Dean & Co., a high-class retail and wholesale store that operated between the Civil War and World War I. Other residents were also owners of shops on Main or State Street areas or employed by these shops and businesses. During the early 20th century, they included a bike dealer, book keeper, book seller, cigar manufacturer, clothiers, department store owners and salesmen, shoe store owner, draftsman, carpenter, dressmakers, druggists, grocers, insurance salesmen, jewelers, livery operators, mailman, printer, restaurant owner (“Starbuck Restaurant” on State Street), secretary, tailors, teachers, and University of Michigan employees. Professionals residing in the district included University of Michigan dean and professors, bankers, lawyers, dentist, doctor, superintendent of Ann Arbor Public Schools, and politicians. In fact, the stretch along Fifth Avenue in the district could be termed “politician’s row.” Four mayors, two unsuccessful candidates, several council persons (then known as aldermen), one U.S. Congressional representative, and political party leaders lived in the houses standing along that block between William and Packard today.

In addition to commercial expansion along Main and State Streets, the city of Ann Arbor grew with the establishment and growth of the University of Michigan. The University arrived in 1837 and settled on land situated several blocks to the east of the district. In 1841 it opened its doors to students for the first time. The first of many significant growth spurts occurred in the 1850s and 1860s, after Henry Philip Tappan was hired as president in 1852. In 1865 the University of Michigan had the largest enrollment in the United States at 1,145 students.⁷ President Tappan used a Prussian model for the University, one where “professors conducted original research, taught by lecture, and trained graduate students.”⁵ As part of this approach, the University stopped providing room and board for students in 1852 and asked the local residents to open up their homes to house students. This arrangement provided additional income for many local families throughout the city.

By the 1870s Ann Arbor had evolved into a “university town.” The evolutions of the town and university have been invariably linked. The University spawned several building booms that expanded the university and the city at the same time. During the 19th and early 20th centuries, the city raised money through bonds and donations to construct university buildings. Several times, especially after the Civil

⁷ Joseph A. Firsinger, *Passport to Ann Arbor*, 1965.

War, World War I, and World War II, large influxes of students created housing shortages. Residents were asked to build on their vacant lots to accommodate the need.

During the second half of the 19th century, the University of Michigan developed its School of Medicine and University Hospitals. Begun in 1850, the School of Medicine became one of the better known programs in the United States. The University was also the first such school to establish a teaching hospital on campus in 1869. Between 1875 and 1945, at the same time as the medical program and hospital/clinical program grew, Ann Arbor played host to seventeen private hospitals scattered around the downtown area.⁸ All were housed in modified private homes. The hospitals served as a place for patients to go if they needed care that could not be obtained at home. One of these hospitals was located at 416 South Fifth Avenue and was known as the Burrett-Smith Private Hospital. After serving as a private residence for almost 50 years, this stately Greek Revival was used by Drs. Cyrus Burrett and Dean Smith, who moved their practice there from 721 East Washington. At the north end of Fourth Avenue, the Jacobs mansion also served as the private hospital of Dr. Lynds until 1918, just before it became Muehlig's Funeral Home now situated in the William Street Historic District.

By 1900 Ann Arbor had a population of 14,509 and the University of Michigan had 3,441 students and 166 faculty members. In 1903 the University acquired additional land to expand and both the city and school were experiencing building booms. Francis Hamilton, Ann Arbor's mayor from 1905 to 1907, lived at 427 South Fifth Avenue during this time. He served as an alderman for the First Ward, and developed Hamilton Place located to the rear of his home just outside the eastern boundary of the proposed district. The development included tightly packed houses constructed close to the street. The 1920s also reflected the increased growth for the city and university.

As in other neighborhoods near the university campus, a number of properties in the district accommodated the growing numbers of University students and faculty, primarily by families taking in boarders. For example, Mrs. Allmendinger took in a number of tenants in her property at 414 South Fourth Avenue. As early as the 1910s the house at 445 South Fifth Avenue was taking in boarders as well. Mrs. Hughes had tenants at 441 South Fifth Avenue that included students and faculty at the University of Michigan. A few houses started to be converted over into apartments to accommodate the growing need for student housing. Possibly due to the housing crisis after World War I, the Gaskell-Beakes house was converted into apartments in the 1920s, one of the earliest conversions in the proposed district. At approximately the same time, the former house across the street at 420 South Fifth Avenue was called the Forsythe House, offering a home to ten female university students.⁹ Another early conversion to apartments was the house at 507 South Fifth Ave., which was modified into four units in 1936.

After World War II the composition of the district began to change. Some of the early German families moved out of the district while others continue to remain to the present. Ann Arbor and the University of Michigan were poised for post-war growth. Many more families in Ann Arbor and in the district rented rooms to returning war veterans enrolling at the university. In the 1960s increasingly more

⁸ Grace Shackman, "The Private Hospital Era." *Ann Arbor Observer*, March 1994.

⁹ Graham's Student Directory, 1926-27, (354).

houses in the district became rental units catering to the university community.¹⁰ However, unlike the neighborhood to the immediate east, many houses remain as single family homes. Regardless of use, all the houses within the district have maintained their original residential appearance.

SIGNIFICANCE OF THE DISTRICT

The significance of the proposed district as a whole was evaluated using methodology outlined in PA 169 of 1970, as amended, and Chapter 103, Section 8:408 of Ann Arbor City Code. The Study Committee was guided by the criteria for evaluation issued by the U.S. Secretary of the Interior for inclusion of resources in the National Register of Historic Places (36 CFR 60). Further, in 2002, the State Historic Preservation Office, per Section 399.205 (3) of PA 169, adopted rules regarding local historic district designation that every study committee is required to follow. Those rules state that any local historic district--single or multiple resource--"shall follow" the criteria for listing in the National Register.¹¹

To be considered eligible for listing (and hence be designated as historically significant), a property (or district) must meet National Register requirements for age, integrity, and significance, as described on the National Register website:

- **Age and Integrity.** Is the property old enough to be considered historic (generally at least 50 years old) and does it still look much the way it did in the past?
- **Significance.** Is the property associated with events, activities, or developments that were important in the past? With the lives of people who were important in the past? With significant architectural history, landscape history, or engineering achievements? Does it have the potential to yield information through archeological investigation about our past?

An eligible property must possess integrity and meet at least one of four criteria for significance:

“The quality of significance in American history, architecture, archeology, engineering, and culture is present in districts, sites, buildings, structures, and objects that possess integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association, and:

- A. that are **associated with events** that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or
- B. that are **associated with the lives of persons** significant in our past; or
- C. that **embody the distinctive characteristics** of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or
- D. that **have yielded, or may be likely to yield, information** important in prehistory or history.”

¹⁰ Lela Duff, *Ann Arbor Yesterdays*, 1962, (31).

¹¹ National Register Bulletin No. 15. Criteria A, National Register of Historic Places. See section below for criteria.

Collectively, the historic resources within the proposed Fourth and Fifth Avenue Historic District are historically significant under National Register criteria A. Several of the resources also meet criteria B and C at the local level of significance. The period of significance begins in 1838, the date of construction of the first extant resource. It ends in 1941, at the beginning of World War II, when the combination of changes in the modern lifestyle, the advent of the automobile, the growth of the adjacent commercial and University areas of the city and the rapid assimilation of the German community into the English-speaking world changed the residential make-up of the neighborhood.

Criterion A. “...that are associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.”

The proposed Fourth and Fifth Avenue historic district meets criterion A because it encompasses a residential neighborhood that was established in and has survived since Ann Arbor’s earliest days. It provides an excellent physical representation of a neighborhood founded in the nineteenth century and evolved through the first half of the twentieth century. Its scale and location relative to Ann Arbor’s downtown and the University of Michigan made it a desirable home to many of Ann Arbor’s early settlers, and later to business and political leaders and their employees at a time before the advent of the automobile enabled citizens to live much farther out. That desirability is expressed in the application of architectural styles prevalent for the period, the arrival of a second wave of development (resulting in the rebuilding of many older resources through additions, reconstruction, and moving) around the turn of the 20th century, and in the arrival and development of a new campus for one of the city’s oldest religious institutions. Despite the overturn of some residents, the nature and character of the individual historic resources within the proposed district have remained the same, as has their relationship to each other and the surrounding districts and neighborhoods. This is primarily because the function served by these resources has also remained constant over time. Over the last decades, the downtown lifestyle and appreciation for the uniqueness of the older structures are experiencing a renewed interest, enabling the historic resources to continue to be a functional part of the modern world.

Criterion B. “...that are associated with the lives of persons significant in our past.”

The district meets criterion B because it contains the homes of several prominent Ann Arbor citizens who were locally important to the development of the city. The resources are the strongest remaining physical connection to their lives and contributions. The Gaskell/Beakes House at 415 South Fifth Avenue is associated with two of Ann Arbor’s past mayors, Hiram Beakes (1873-1875, 15th mayor) and Samuel Beakes (1888-1890, 24th mayor). The former was also a state representative from 1863-64 and Probate Judge of Washtenaw County in the 1870s. The latter oversaw revision to create the City’s fourth charter which was adopted in 1889 and also served as First Ward alderman, chair of the county Democratic Party, city treasurer, and representative in the U.S. Congress. He was the editor of the Democratic oriented *Ann Arbor Argus*. Beakes Street is named after Samuel Beakes who also wrote *Past and Present of Washtenaw County Michigan* in 1906.

427 South Fifth Avenue was the home of Francis M. Hamilton (b. 1839) until his death in 1914 at the age of 75. He was the First Ward alderman before becoming a Republican mayor of Ann Arbor from 1905-1907 (34th mayor). He was in the real estate business and developed Hamilton Place, a closely clustered group of houses situated to the east of the district. He also built many houses on William St, Fifth Ave and North University Ave. He gave the University of Michigan a fountain located at North University and State Street.

433 South Fifth Avenue was the home of Herbert Slauson from 1905 through the 1930s. Slauson was a long-time superintendent of the Ann Arbor Public Schools and has a school named after him, Slauson Middle School. He was a descendant of an 1820s pioneering family.

438 South Fifth Avenue was the home of Erwin Schmid. He also built and lived in the house at 444 South Fifth Avenue, and the two houses share the wrought iron fence dating from the before Schmid's time. Schmid was a direct descendant of Pastor Schmid, the pioneering German Lutheran pastor responsible for establishing over 20 congregations in southeastern Michigan during the 19th century. Erwin Schmid was a partner in a hardware and furniture business known as Muehlig and Schmid and a banker. Over his relatively short life (60 years), he contributed extensively to the city, serving on the city council (including a term as chair: 1913-1915 and several appointments to the Board of Appeals). He was a member of the Board of Fire Commissioners (1920-1935), a member of the Ann Arbor Board of Education (1919-1928, including president of the Board, 1920-1924), superintendent of the Zion Lutheran school and a church leader. Finally, he also served as a member of the Forest Hills Cemetery Association board, from 1916 until his death in 1936.

444 South Fifth Avenue was the home of William C. Walz, who besides serving as a two-term mayor from 1909 to 1913 was also a leader in the banking industry. During the last year of his mayoral tenure the Civic Association attempted to initiate a charter revision that would echo the form of government of Dayton, Ohio, however the committee was not elected until 1916. Before becoming mayor he was president of the city council from 1907-1909. He was treasurer of the Democratic state central committee and was Democratic county chair almost continuously from 1912-1941 and was a delegate to state and national conventions. He served as president of the Michigan State Banker's Association from 1936-37.¹²

426 South Fourth Avenue was the home of Jacob Polhemus a prominent businessman and community member in Washtenaw County and Ann Arbor in the mid to late 19th century. He owned a successful livery business in Ann Arbor, however his business and civic activities took him throughout Michigan and the Midwest. By 1862, he owned 320 acres in Scio Township where he served as Township Supervisor from 1840-51. In 1867 Polhemus purchased the N.B. Livery located at the south-east corner of Main and Catherine; eventually, his grandson, Joseph Polhemus, became a partner. The Polhemus Hack And Bus Transfer Co, remained in business beyond Jacob's death, evolving to service motorized transportation well into the 20th century. Polhemus was known for his hospitality and generosity and donated to construct St. Andrew's Church.

¹² "William C. Walz Succumbs Suddenly After Heart Attack" *Ann Arbor News*, September 1, 1941, pg. 1.

Criterion C. “...that embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction.”

The district meets criterion C because it contains an intact collection of Greek Revival, Queen Anne, and Italianate style houses, representative of the district’s evolution in the second half of the 19th century in addition to a collection of later replacement houses that were constructed in the Colonial Revival, Dutch Colonial Revival, and Arts and Crafts styles.

Two buildings in the proposed district are architect designed. Bethlehem Church, located at 423 South Fourth Avenue and constructed in 1895, was designed by Detroit architect Richard Rasemann in the Romanesque Revival style with Gothic influences. A 1933 addition was designed by Thomas S. Tanner or Ralph W. Hammett (sources differ). The Erwin E. Schmid house at 438 South Fifth Avenue was designed by architect Herman Pipp in the Arts and Crafts Style.

CONCLUSION

The Fourth and Fifth Avenue proposed historic district is a small, but cohesive residential neighborhood on the south side of downtown Ann Arbor. It is the surviving portion of a once larger residential neighborhood that served as the home to some of Ann Arbor’s early residents, and many of its merchants and other businessmen of the late 19th and early 20th century. In addition, leaders of local politics, religion, and the German community and its descendants established their homes in this neighborhood. The neighborhood’s history mirrors that of Ann Arbor’s, and its historic resources reveal the once lively and fashionable neighborhood that it once was, both from an architectural point of view, as well as from an association with the early settlers, businessmen, immigrants, University of Michigan, and political leaders.

The committee recommends that the proposed Fourth and Fifth Avenue Historic District be designated by the Ann Arbor City Council as a local historic district. The district is significant for the physical link it maintains to the early settlement period of Ann Arbor, for its association with German life in Ann Arbor and association with several Ann Arbor civic and political leaders.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Ann Arbor Sesquicentennial Committee. *Ann Arbor Sesquicentennial*. 1974 (January, April and August editions).
- Ann Arbor Village Plat Map, 1824.
- Ann Arbor, Michigan*. Panoramic Maps, 1866 and 1890.
- Beakes, Samuel W. *Past and Present of Washtenaw County, Michigan*. The S. J. Clarke Publishing Co., Chicago, 1906.
- Bechler, G. R. and E. Wenig. *Map of Washtenaw County, Michigan*. Bechler and Wenig, Co., publishers, Philadelphia, 1856. Republished by the Washtenaw County Genealogical Society, Nancy Krohn and Mary L. Liskow, eds., 1997.
- Bechler, G. R. and E. Wenig. *Map of the Counties of Washtenaw and Lenawee, Michigan*. Samuel Geil, publisher, Philadelphia, 1864. Republished in part by the Washtenaw County Genealogical Society, Nancy Krohn and Mary L. Liskow, eds., 1997.
- Beck and Pauli. *Panoramic View of the City of Ann Arbor, Michigan*. Madison: J.J. Stoner, 1880.
- Bennett, Francis. *Churches of Ann Arbor*. Student Paper, University of Michigan College of Architecture: 1935.
- Bethlehem Evangelical Church, *Centennial Program, A Century of Progress, 1833-1933*. Ann Arbor, MI: Sunday, August 27, 1933.
- Bethlehem Evangelical Church, *The Story of Bethlehem Church, 1833-1973*. Ann Arbor, MI: Bethlehem United Church of Christ (self-published), 1973.
- Chapin, H.H. *Chapin's City Directory for Ann Arbor*. Adrian: H. H. Chapin, 1868.
- Chapman, Charles. *History of Washtenaw County, Michigan, Volumes I and II*. Chicago: Charles C. Chapman & Co., 1881.
- City of Ann Arbor Plat Maps, 1854, 1869, 1870 and Panoramic Map, 1890.
- Cocks, III, J. Fraser (editor), Ann Arbor Sesquicentennial Committee. *Pictorial History of Ann Arbor 1824-1974*. Michigan Historical Collections/Bentley Historic Library. July 1974.
- Cole, James M., John W. Keating. *Cole and Keating's Ann Arbor Directory*. Ann Arbor: Courier Steam Printing House, 1872.
- Combination Atlas Map of Washtenaw County, Michigan*. Everts and Stewart, Chicago, Illinois, 1874. Republished by the Ypsilanti Historical Society, Ypsilanti, Michigan, 1981.

- Deye, David. "Ann Arbor's Architect, Herman Pipp (1868-1945)" *Washtenaw Junior Historian*. June, 1956, Volume 1, No. 2.
- Duff, Lela. *Ann Arbor Yesterdays*. Ann Arbor: Friends of the Ann Arbor Public Library, 1962.
- Frisinger, Joseph A. *Passport to Ann Arbor*. Self-published, 1965.
- Goff, Alice and Megan Cooney. *Historic Photos of Ann Arbor*. Nashville: Turner Publishing Company, 2007.
- Graham's Student Directory, 1926-27*.
- Hart, Henry. *Map of City of Ann Arbor, Washtenaw Co. Michigan*. Henry Hart, Surveyor, 1853.
- Hawes, George W. *Loomis and Talbots Ann Arbor and Ypsilanti City Directory for 1860. In One Vol.* Detroit: Loomis and Talbot, 1860.
- Hutzel, Emerson E. *The Schmid Letters—A translation of letters written between the years 1833 and 1879 by Pastor Friedrich Schmid, Pioneer German Missionary, from Ann Arbor, Michigan, to his Seminary in Basel, Switzerland*. St. Louis, MO., 1953.
- Individual Historic Properties Historic District Study Committee. *Appendix A: Documentation of Individual Historic Properties, In Alphabetical Order by Address, Grouped by Category of Significance*. Ann Arbor, Michigan. September 8, 1994.
- Kern, Esther A., undated letter to Mrs. Nickolas Kokkales.
- "List of Mayors of Ann Arbor, Michigan" *Wikipedia*.
http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_mayors_of_Ann_Arbor,_Michigan accessed May 14, 2010.
- Marwil, Jonathan. *A History of Ann Arbor*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1987.
- Mills, Glen V. *Glen V. Mills Directory of the City of Ann Arbor*. Glen V. Mills, 1905.
- National Park Service. *National Register Bulletin 15: How to Apply the National Register Criteria*. Washington DC: U.S. Department of the Interior.
- The Political Graveyard*, <http://politicalgraveyard.com/geo/MI/ofc/annarbor.html>, accessed May 14, 2010.
- Polk, R.L. ed. *City Directory of Ann Arbor*. Detroit: R.L Polk. Various years, 1868 – 1960.
- Proctor, Hazel, ed. *Old Ann Arbor Town*. Second edition. Ann Arbor: Great Lakes Federal Savings, 1978.
- Reade, Marjorie and Susan Wineberg. *Historic Buildings, Ann Arbor, Michigan*. 2nd edition. Ann Arbor: Ann Arbor Historical Foundation and Ann Arbor Historic District Commission, 1998.

Sanborn Map Company. *Maps of Ann Arbor Michigan*. 1888, 1892, 1899, 1908, 1916, 1925, 1931 and 1948.

Shackman, Grace. *Ann Arbor in the 20th Century, A Photographic History*. Charleston: Arcadia Publishing, 2002.

Shackman, Grace. ““The Private Hospital Era.” *Ann Arbor Observer*, March 1994.

Shackman, Grace. “Then and Now” *Ann Arbor Observer*. Various articles, accessed through the Ann Arbor District Library, <http://aaobserver.aadl.org/aaobserver/browse>. January 8, 2010.

Shackman, Grace. *Ann Arbor Observed*. University of Michigan Press, Ann Arbor, Michigan, 2006.

Schweitzer, Robert and Michael W. R. Davis. *America’s Favorite Homes*. Wayne State University Press, Detroit, 1990.

Stephenson, Ph.D., O.W. *Ann Arbor- The First Hundred Years*. Ann Arbor, Michigan: Ann Arbor Chamber of Commerce, 1927.

State Historic Preservation Office. *Local Historic Districts in Michigan*. Lansing: Michigan Historical Center.

“William C. Walz Succumbs Suddenly After Heart Attack.” *Ann Arbor News*, September 1 , 1941.

Wineberg, Susan. *Lost Ann Arbor, Images of America Series*. Charleston: Arcadia Publishing, 2004.

Year: 1850; Census Place: *Ann Arbor City, Washtenaw County, Michigan*; Page 56. <http://www.ancestry.com>. February 2010.

Year: 1860; Census Place: *Ann Arbor City 1st Ward, Washtenaw County, Michigan*; Page 59. <http://www.ancestry.com>. February 2010.

Year: 1880; Census Place: *Ann Arbor City 1st Ward, Washtenaw County, Michigan*; Page 32; Enumeration District 223. <http://www.ancestry.com>. February 2010.

Year: 1880; Census Place: *Ann Arbor City 1st Ward, Washtenaw County, Michigan*; Page 44; Enumeration District 223. <http://www.ancestry.com>. February 2010.

Year: 1880; Census Place: *Ann Arbor City 1st Ward, Washtenaw County, Michigan*; Page 14; Enumeration District 229. <http://www.ancestry.com>. February 2010.

DISTRICT MAP



PHOTOGRAPHS



Photograph 1 – East side of Fifth Avenue looking south, February 2010



Photograph 2 – West side of Fourth Avenue looking south, February 2010



Photograph 3 – 438 South Fifth Avenue, designed by Herman Pipp, September 2009



Photograph 4 – 423 South Fourth Avenue, Bethlehem Evangelical Church, February 2010



Photograph 5 – 450 South Fifth Avenue – Ditz/Stampfler House, September 2009



Photograph 6 – 415 South Fifth Avenue, Gaskell/Beakes House, February 2010



Photographs 7 & 8 – 432 South Fourth Avenue, house (former Bethlehem Church parsonage) and accompanying garage, September 2009, February 2010



Photograph 9 – 120 Packard, Wines/Dean House, November 2009



Photograph 10 – Mature lilac bush and trees at 120 Packard, February 2010



Photograph 11 – 306 Packard, November 2009



Photograph 12 – 442 South Fourth Avenue, Gottlieb Wild house, February 2010



Photograph 13 – Detail of wood and wrought iron fence at 442 South Fourth Avenue, February 2010



Photograph 14 – Barn at 215 Packard Street, February 2010



Photograph 15 – Mature tree between 306 and 314 Packard Street, February 2010



Photograph 16 – Wrought iron fence at 444 and 438 South Fifth Avenue, looking north, February 2010

ATTACHMENT A

Survey Sheets for properties within the proposed district (separate electronic documents)