SOLID WASTE RESOURCES MANAGEMENT PLAN

ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETING #3

April 23, 2019
WELCOMING COMMENTS

Updates re: City activities impacting the SWRMP

Advisory on Steven Brown’s April 5th email re: SWRMP/APTIM Citizen Advisory Committee statement of concern

Agenda review and desired outcomes poll

Review of January 15th meeting summary
KEY ACCOMPLISHMENTS SINCE MEETING #2

✓ Contract extensions
  • City staff completing contract extensions for commercial waste franchise, cart recycling collection, and recyclables processing

✓ Public engagement
  • Resident telephone survey fielded March 24th - 31st

✓ Research and analysis to inform recommendations:
  • Program and service options, including preliminary staffing / resource needs and cost estimates
### SUMMARY OF RESIDENTIAL SECTOR OPTIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Residential Sector Options</th>
<th>Benefits</th>
<th>Ratings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Increase Diversion</td>
<td>Reduce Toxics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year-Round Residential Compost Collection</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curbside Textile Collection</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulky Waste Collection</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-Waste and HHW Collection</td>
<td>✔️</td>
<td>✔️</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Rating Scale**
- High
- Medium
- Low
RESIDENTIAL OPTIONS: ANNUAL COST IMPACT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Service</th>
<th>Estimated Direct Cost</th>
<th>Estimated Cost per Ton Managed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Year-Round Compost Collection</td>
<td>$100,000</td>
<td>$100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curbside Textile Collection</td>
<td>$500,000</td>
<td>$500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulky Waste Collection</td>
<td>$800,000</td>
<td>$800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curbside E-Waste &amp; HHW Collection</td>
<td>$2,000,000</td>
<td>$2,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Low Estimate
- High Estimate
- Cost per Ton (High)
- Cost per Ton (Low)
RESIDENTIAL OPTIONS: SMALL GROUP DISCUSSION

1. Which option(s) knocked your socks off - and why?

2. Which option(s) turned you off - and why?

3. What questions do you have about any option(s) that must be answered for you to have a serious opinion about the option?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Commercial Sector Options</th>
<th>Benefits</th>
<th>Ratings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Increase Diversion</td>
<td>Reduce Toxics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fats, Oils, and Grease (FOG) Management</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commercial Organics Collection</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Move-In / Move-Out Collection</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C&amp;D Waste</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commercial Services Participation Enforcement</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
COMMERCIAL OPTIONS: ANNUAL COST IMPACT

Estimated Cost Per Ton Managed

Estimated Annual Direct Cost

- FOG Management
- Commercial Organics Collection
- Student Move-In / Move-Out Collection
- C&D Waste
- Commercial Services Participation Enforcement

Cost per Ton (High)
Cost per Ton (Low)

Low Estimate
High Estimate
COMMERCIAL OPTIONS: SMALL GROUP DISCUSSION

1. Which option(s) knocked your socks off - and why?

2. Which option(s) turned you off - and why?

3. What questions do you have about any option(s) that must be answered for you to have a serious opinion about the option?
**DOWNTOWN / ALLEY OPTIONS**

**Alt. A - 7-Day Collection, Mandatory Saturday & Sunday for Restaurants / Bars**

**Alt. B - Consolidated Containers and 7-Day Collection with Special Assessment**

**Alt. C - Consolidated Underground Containers and 7-Day Collection with Special Assessment**

**Alt. D - Bag-Based Collection with Twice Daily Pickup**
## SUMMARY OF DOWNTOWN / ALLEY OPTIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rating Scale</th>
<th>Benefits</th>
<th>Ratings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="High Rating" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Medium Rating" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Low Rating" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Downtown / Alley Collection Service Improvement Options

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option Description</th>
<th>Alley Accessibility</th>
<th>Public Health</th>
<th>Aesthetics</th>
<th>Implementation Effort</th>
<th>Zero Waste Alignment</th>
<th>Direct Cost</th>
<th>GHG Reduction</th>
<th>Responsive to Public Input</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alt. A - 7-Day Collection, Mandatory Saturday &amp; Sunday for Restaurants / Bars</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="High Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Medium Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Low Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Low Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Low Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="High Rating" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alt. B - Consolidated Containers and 7-Day Collection with Special Assessment</td>
<td>✓ ✓ ✓</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="High Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Medium Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Low Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Low Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Low Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Low Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="High Rating" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alt. C - Consolidated Underground Containers and 7-Day Collection with Special Assessment</td>
<td>✓ ✓ ✓</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="High Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Medium Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Low Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Low Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Low Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Low Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="High Rating" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alt. D - Bag-Based Collection with Twice Daily Pickup</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="High Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Medium Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Low Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Low Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Low Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Low Rating" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="High Rating" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DOWNTOWN / ALLEY OPTIONS: SMALL GROUP DISCUSSION

1. Which TWO of these alternatives should be given the most consideration?

2. If you have a strong feeling about ANY alternative - please share.

3. What questions do you have about any alternative?
RESIDENT SURVEY RESULTS

Survey fielded March 24th - 31st

- 15 minute questionnaire
- 400 responses
- Margin of error = ±4.9% at 95% confidence level

Broad range of topics

- Satisfaction with current services
- Recycling and compost practices
- Bulky item, e-waste, and HHW practices and needs
- Education needs and methods of receiving information
- Payment / funding options support
SURVEY SAYS...SATISFACTION IS HIGH

Garbage Collection Satisfaction

Recycling Collection Satisfaction

Compost Collection Satisfaction

City of Ann Arbor Solid Waste Resources Management Plan

Satisfied  | Dissatisfied  | DK/Ref
---|---|---
96 | 30 | 30

Satisfied  | Dissatisfied  | DK/Ref
---|---|---
30 | 33 | 60

Satisfied  | Dissatisfied  | DK/Ref
---|---|---
60 | 33 | 60

Satisfied  | Dissatisfied  | DK/Ref
---|---|---
37 | 11 | 23

Very Satisfied

Somewhat Satisfied
SURVEY SAYS...RESIDENTS HAVE A NEED FOR MORE INFORMATION - EVEN ON CURRENT SERVICES

Do you feel you need more information from the City about...?

| Service                                      | Need More Information | Total
|----------------------------------------------|-----------------------|-------
| Electronics and household hazard wastes disposal options | 57                    | 43    |
| Bulky item disposal options                  | 55                    | 45    |
| All city resources management services       | 46                    | 53    |
| Compost services                             | 39                    | 61    |
| Recycling services                           | 39                    | 60    |
| Garbage services                             | 21                    | 79    |

Are you aware that if you have a compost cart you can put food waste including meat, bones, fruits and vegetables in it?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Awareness</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Refused</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>57</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>43</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refused</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

What is the biggest reason you don’t put more food waste in the compost cart?

*(Among Respondents who throw a little/note of their waste in the cart)*

- Didn’t know food waste could go in the... 25%
- I compost in my backyard 15%
- Too messy/smelly 11%
- Not convenient 7%
- Foods goes in the garbage can or in-sink... 7%

What is the biggest factor that limits the amount that you recycle?

*(Among those unable to recycle as much as they can)*

- Don't know what is recyclable 33%
- Cart is too small 18%
- It is not convenient 8%
SURVEY SAYS...RESIDENTS WANT ADDITIONAL SERVICES, AND ARE WILLING TO PAY FOR THEM

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Service</th>
<th>Not willing</th>
<th>Willing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bulky waste collection</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year-round compost collection</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expanded household hazardous waste options</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expanded electronic wastes options</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clothing and other textiles collections</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None, don't want any increase</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Willingness to Pay for Additional Services

- $1-$3 per month: 9 (Not willing), 64 (Willing), 89 (Total)
- $4-$5 per month: 28 (Not willing), 14 (Willing), 70 (Total)
- $6-$7 per month: 32 (Not willing), 13 (Willing), 67 (Total)
- $8-$10 per month: 46 (Not willing), 26 (Willing), 52 (Total)
SURVEY SAYS... RESIDENTS FAVOR COSTS BASED ON HOME VALUE OR GARBAGE CART SIZE

Options for Paying for Garbage, Recycling, and Compost Services

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Fees Based on Value of Home</th>
<th>Fixed Monthly Bill</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Support</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oppose</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(DK/Ref)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Neither)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Paying for Different Sizes of Garbage Carts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>$27 / $29 / $31</th>
<th>$27 / $54 / $81</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Support</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oppose</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(DK/Ref)</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Neither)</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SURVEY SAYS...RESIDENTS ARE MORE LIKELY TO EAT OR SHOP AT SUSTAINABLY-MINDED BUSINESSES

This question was included based on input from Community High School’s Urban Planning Community Resource (CR) students working on a solid waste education and outreach project in collaboration with the City:

Would you be more likely to eat or shop at sustainably-minded businesses?

- Yes: 70
- No: 28
- (Don't know): 2
CURRENT ANN ARBOR PUBLIC EDUCATION EFFORTS

Review of current outreach and education efforts

• Jennifer Petoskey, Ann Arbor Solid Waste Outreach and Compliance Specialist

Highlight on Community High School program

• Heather Seyfarth, Ann Arbor Community Engagement Specialist

Business Outreach Ideas

• Informing businesses on how to recycle properly
  ○ Going door to door
  ○ Meeting with businesses and making in part of their staff training (short videos)
• Ranking System for being green
  ○ Different stickers or badges depending on what the business does to be eco-friendly
• Stickers on trash cans, recycling bins and dumpsters to help remind employees
• Creating brochures about recycling and composting in different languages
• Sending businesses social media assets that can be easily posted on Instagram, Twitter, Facebook etc.

Our Idea

• Educate Community High students about eco-friendly ways to impact our community and reduce solid waste
• Put slides each week in forum

Solid Waste Youth Education Project

Impacting Your City CR
WHAT’S NEXT?

Environmental Commission update and input - April 25th

Draft the SWRMP report
• Identify resource requirements, funding methods, and service delivery
• Present recommendations and implementation guidance

City staff activities
• Finalize contract extensions with RAA and Waste Management
• Interface with Environmental Commission’s Solid Waste Work Group
• Review draft SWRMP report
• Outreach to potentially coordinate Community High School group presentation for next meeting
KEEP UPDATED ON THE PROGRESS OF THE SWRMP

Website: www.a2gov.org/SWRMP
Email: SWRMP@a2gov.org

Individual Contacts:

Cresson Slotten  Christina Seibert  Charlie Fleetham
Project Manager  Project Manager  Lead Facilitator
City of Ann Arbor  APTIM  Project Innovations
(734) 794-6430 x 43701  (630) 762-3306  (248) 476-7577
cslotten@a2gov.org  christina.seibert@aptim.com  charlie@projectinnovations.com