Commercial Building Efficiency Advisory Committee

Meeting 4: Policy Design
Welcome and Introductions

City of Ann Arbor Staff Introductions
Thea Yagerlener, Energy Analyst
Zach Waas Smith, Community Engagement Specialist
1. Welcome and Introductions
2. Review Ground Rules and Expectations
3. Transparency and Data Discussion
4. Exemption Discussion
5. Schedule and Responsible Party Discussion
6. Closeout
Round Table Introductions

- Name, Pronouns, Organization and Role
Ground Rules

• Stay engaged
  • Minimize distractions
  • Grab something to write with, a drink, a snack

• Chatham House Rules
  • Share the information, not the person

• Practice democracy of time

• Constructive mindset: Deliberation should be positive and future-directed
Expectations of City Staff

• We will look to you for advice and innovation in formulating a solution and will incorporate your advice and recommendations into the decisions to the maximum extent possible.

• Ensure this time serves the stakeholders in the room

• Be available to answer questions and address concerns

benchmarking@a2gov.org
Tyagerlener@a2gov.org
ZWaasSmith@a2gov.org
Expectations of Task Force

• Provide your expertise and lived experience
• Leverage networks to represent a larger group of voices
• Final Product: Co-creating policy recommendations

What do you need to be successful?
## Decision Process and Timeline

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Q4 2020</th>
<th>Q1 2021</th>
<th>Q2 2021</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Stakeholder Task Force</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Public Input</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open Public Feedback</td>
<td>Public Comment Period</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>City of Ann Arbor</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ordinance Approval Process</td>
<td></td>
<td>Implementation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Includes legal review*
Suite of Programs

- Public, Commercial and Multifamily
- Rentals
- Single Family Housing
Commercial Benchmarking Scope

**Benchmarking:** An established program to understand how a building is performing compared to itself and similar buildings

**Transparency:** Sharing information with the market to value energy efficiency and drive market transformation

*Not a performance standard*
Progress To Date

1. Framed the opportunity to help our evaluation:
   1. Improve experience and impact of all occupants
   2. Achieve net positive change considering all costs and benefits
   3. Establish clear goals, steps, and criteria for success and track improvement
   4. Reflect priorities of current and new stakeholders

2. Benchmarking 101

3. Energy Efficiency Review and Examples

4. Discussed Building Size and Sectors
Policy Direction
Benchmarking Policy Elements

• Covered Market Sectors
• Covered Building Size
• Transparency approach
• Benchmarking and Transparency Exemptions
• Schedule for initial benchmarking and transparency
• Party responsible for reporting
• Data Verification Approach
➢ Beyond benchmarking
➢ Implementation
Benchmarking Policy Elements

• Covered Market Sectors
• Covered Building Size
• Transparency approach
• Benchmarking and Transparency Exemptions
• Schedule for initial benchmarking and transparency
• Party responsible for reporting
• Data Verification Approach
  ➢ Beyond benchmarking
  ➢ Implementation
**Typical Process**

**Benchmarking Process**

- **BENCHMARKING:** Ongoing review of building energy performance compared to itself as well as other buildings of similar size.

- **Provides space use data**
  - Tenants

- **Submits data to local jurisdiction**
  - Building Owner/Manager

- **Provides whole building data**
  - Utilities

**Local Jurisdiction Data Management System**

- **Performance Metrics and Report**
  - Individualized and actionable info

- **Identify underperformers in your portfolio and set priorities for staff time and investment capital**

**Public Website**

- **Public**

**TRANSPARENCY:** Public disclosure of specific pieces of benchmarking data

**REPORTING:** Submitting a building’s energy and water use to the City annually

- **Financing Programs and Energy Service Providers**
  - Building Owner/Manager

**Typical Process**

- **FREE and web-based tool, no out of pocket costs to comply**
  - Fast and easy process, takes 4 – 8 hours once a year
ENERGY STAR Portfolio Manager Process

ENERGY STAR Portfolio Manager Input

Reported for Compliance

Transparency

Data Collected for All Properties

- Property Name
- Property Address
- Total Gross Floor Area of Property
- Irrigated Area
- Year Built/Planned for Construction Completion
- Occupancy
- Number of Buildings
- 12 consecutive months of energy data

Additional Data Collected for Office

The following information is required to get an ENERGY STAR score (if eligible):

- Gross Floor Area
- Weekly Operating Hours
- Number of Workers on Main Shift
- Number of Computers
- Percent That Can Be Cooled

The following information is optional and not used to calculate a score, it may inform future analysis and score revisions by EPA and/or may help you manage and compare your properties:

- Percent That Can Be Heated
**ENERGY STAR Score**

1 – **100 Score**: Helps assess how a building is doing and identify opportunities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score Below 50</th>
<th>Score = 50</th>
<th>Score Over 50</th>
<th>Score Over 75</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Performing worse that 50% of similar buildings nationwide</td>
<td>Median</td>
<td>Performing better than 50 percent of its peers</td>
<td>Top performer, may be eligible for ENERGY STAR certification</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Poor performers save the most:**

**2X as much as buildings with higher scores**

- Evaluates actual billed energy data
- Normalized for business activity
- Compares to national population, not individual buildings
- Indicated level of performance
Data Reporting

ENERGY STAR Portfolio Manager Input

Reported for Compliance

Transparency

Subset of Data Fields

- Property Name, Address, Type, Size
- ENERGY STAR Score
- Site EUI or Source EUI
- Weather Normalized Site or Source EUI
- Total GHG Emissions
- % Difference from National Median Source EUI
- Default or Temporary Values
- List of All Property Use Types
- Property Notes: Age of building, Comments
Data Transparency Process

ENERGY STAR Portfolio Manager Input

Reported for Compliance

Transparency

Visualizations

Scorecards

Visualizations for the Cities of Philadelphia, New York, and Boston (top to bottom)

City of Seattle

City of Philadelphia

Infographics

City of Chicago

USDN and IMT
Policy Variable: Exemptions

Benchmarking vs Transparency

- Residential buildings with less than 5 units
- Standard Industrial Classification
- Properties owned by government bodies not subject to the authority of the City
- Buildings facing financial hardship
- Unoccupied/vacant: No permit, less than 50% occupied
- Planned to be demolished
- Does not receive energy/water utility
- Not in the public interest
Close Out
Next Meetings

➢ **ADDITIONAL MEETING:** Jan 22 10 – 11:30 AM

➢ Open to public comment

➢ Final Meeting (TBD): Responding to public comment and finalize recommendations
Thank You for Your Time!

Thea: TYagerlener@a2gov.org
Zach: ZWaasSmith@a2gov.org