



ANNUAL REPORT OF THE ANN ARBOR HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION TO THE ANN ARBOR CITY COUNCIL FOR THE CALENDAR YEAR 2010

Introduction

In accordance with the bylaws of the Ann Arbor Historic District Commission, an annual report is to be prepared by staff, approved by the Commission, and presented to City Council each year outlining the activities of the Historic District Commission for the previous year.

A Historic District Commissioner retreat was held February 12, 2011. The retreat agenda included review and discussion of: the restoration of a Greek Revival cottage on Pontiac Trail; new HDC guidelines designed to assist applicants and the public; signage policies; and the HDC bylaws.

Statistics

A total of 164 applications were received by the Commission in 2010. This is nearly equal to the 168 applications received in 2009.

The Historic District Commission has delegated a number of minor activities to staff to approve on their behalf, and 112 (or 68%) of the applications received staff Certificates of Appropriateness. Generally speaking, these are routine work activities that do not affect historic materials on a structure, like replacing a non-historic roof with the same. Other examples of some of the thirty-two kinds of work that may be approved by staff, if the work is appropriate, include:

- Replacement of non-original windows or doors
- Replacement of existing awnings and signage in the same size, dimension, and location
- Reconstruction of existing porches
- New or replacement fences
- Replacement of roofs and concrete basement walls

The Commission added one new item to the staff approvals list: the replacement, and in some cases, expansion, of existing decks.

The Commission held hearings on the other 53 during their regular monthly meetings. Of those applications, 49 (or 92%) received Certificates of Appropriateness and four applications (or 8%) were denied. All of the sites were visited prior to their hearing by the HDC Review Committee, which is made up of two Commissioners and staff.

The denied applications included:

- ❑ a request to add a second floor to a one-car brick garage, which was determined to be a contributing structure;
- ❑ a request to remove the muntins from historically divided-light industrial-type windows; and
- ❑ a request to replace 18 wood windows that were determined to be in good condition;
- ❑ a request to add a side addition to a garage -- the request was later resubmitted with modifications and was approved.

Awards

Each year, the Historic District Commission presents Historic Preservation Awards to property owners who have shown dedication to preservation by rehabilitating or maintaining their historic property. The Ann Arbor Historic District Commission's 2010 awards were presented by Mayor John Hieftje during the June 7, 2010 City Council meeting. A reception for award recipients was held at the Hands On Museum preceding the ceremony at City Council.

Rehabilitation Awards

Rehabilitation Awards recognize substantial work which returns a property to a state of utility through repair or alteration. The work facilitates contemporary needs but respects the features of the property which are significant to its historic and architectural values.

310 Second - Janet Muhleman

This home is a simple 1-1/2 story Greek Revival with cornice returns which was built before 1853. It was moved to this site in 1898 from the southwest Corner of Liberty and Second, next door, and was the original home of the Schleicher family, local grocers. A Schleicher child's tombstone can be seen behind the second Schleicher home at 403 W. Liberty. Owner Janet Muhleman has removed aluminum siding, restored doors and some original windows, and replaced inappropriate windows with new wood windows. It is in the Old West Side Historic District.

304 South Main Street - Seyfried Jewelers

In May 2009, the shop owners replaced the broken Vitrolite on the front façade with new custom made panels to match the originals. They also restored their sign as well. Seyfried Jewelers have been at this location since 1931 which is probably when the vitrolite panels were added. They celebrated their 75th anniversary in 1986. Jim Hart and his brother bought the company in 1978. The building dates to the 1890s and was originally the Koch and Haller Furniture Store. It is in the Main Street Historic District.

434 South State - Kelsey Museum Upjohn Addition – University of Michigan

The Kelsey Museum added a sensitive addition known as the Upjohn Wing, which faces Maynard Street. Chicago architects Hammond Beeby Rupert Ainge designed the

building to blend with the beauty of the older building. This was accomplished by using similar fieldstone but in a sleeker and more modern configuration. The addition opened to much local acclaim in 2009. The structure was originally built as Newberry Hall in 1888 for the Students' Christian Association and designed by Spier and Rohns, well-known Detroit architects. The Kelsey also cleaned and restored the Fox Tiffany window on the second floor of the original building. It now once again glows at night for all passersby to see.

1102 Olivia – waiting for write-up from Patrick McCauley

1710 Cambridge - Andrew Schmidt

This home was built in 1925 for the Clement Gill family of Gill Lumber and was designed by noted local architect Samuel Stanton in a Georgian Revival style. This style is characteristic of many homes in the Burns Park neighborhood. This home remained in this family with Albert and later David Logan until 2006 when it was sold to the current owner. The owner has restored the built-in gutters, restored the roof and added new copper flashing.

111-113 South Fourth Avenue - Heinrich Building, 111-113 Condominium Association

There was a saloon at this location from the time the first courthouse was built in the 1830s until Prohibition. John Heinrich acquired the property in the 1860s and replaced the old wooden saloon with the brick building at 111 which today contains four units. Despite its similarity in design and appearance, the building at 113 S. Fourth, which began life as a blacksmith and wagon shop, was not built until ca. 1890. Today it contains five units.

These two buildings were the vanguard of the preservation and downtown living movements in the 1970s when Estelle Schneider and Bonnie De Loof created residential units above the commercial space and pioneered loft living in Ann Arbor. Today, condo owners continue the tradition and have recently invested in re-pointing and painting the brick. There are also new window grilles installed.

734 Spring Street - Raymond and Charlotte DeVries

This vernacular house was built in 1922 and first occupied by W. Glenn McFarlane, chief inspector for Motor Products Corporation (later King-Seeley). It has features of the Craftsman style, particularly the use of two cladding materials (clapboard and shingle), and simple porch columns. It changed hands quite often over the following decades, serving as a home for a civil engineer, a carpenter contractor and a driver for the Washtenaw County Road Commission. It eventually became a rental. The current owners have turned it back into a single family home. They have painted and repaired the siding and the chimney and upgraded the landscaping.

Preservation Awards

Preservation awards are given to owners who have undertaken superior maintenance and repair of a significant property to preserve its essential historical, cultural or architectural value for a period of 10 years or more.

1140 Heather Way - Brian and Mary Campbell

This home was built in 1937 by Sam and Catherine McAlister. Their daughter stated that the front door was a copy of one in a house near the Louisa May Alcott home in Concord, Massachusetts and the stairs were copied from Woodford Mansion in Philadelphia's Fairmont Park. Sam McAllister served as University of Michigan administrator of campus libraries and on steering committees for new buildings and was considered a pioneer in library science. He retired from UM in 1959. Brian and Mary Campbell are now the careful stewards of this fine example of Colonial architecture.

1251 Heather Way - Karl and Kristin Shaffer

Originally this was the home of Professor and Mrs. William Muschenheim who had it built by Albert Duckek, also of Ann Arbor, in 1953. Muschenheim, a professor of architecture at the University of Michigan, designed the low, trim, sleek and light-filled modernist home with an eye to the rolling landscape which allowed the home to be built with a full level and several split-levels. Muschenheim had an international reputation as a modernist and many of his interior designs appeared in magazines of the time. He had many major commissions in New York, New Jersey, and Connecticut as well as Michigan and was the author of two books on architecture. At his death in 1990, Muschenheim was the last surviving member of the International Congress of Modern Architects which included Mies van der Rohe, Gropius and LeCorbusier. The home has been wonderfully maintained by the current owners, Karl and Kristin Shaffer, for over 10 years.

120 North State Street - Graham and Bonnie Miles

Graham and Bonnie Miles, owners since the mid-1980s, have taken immaculate care of this rental property at the corner of State and Ann. Graham can often be seen on a ladder doing painting or repairs. The house was built in 1899 for Henry Lum, a physician, when the lot containing the house currently at 712 E. Ann was subdivided. In fact, a notice in the *Ann Arbor Courier* of June 8, 1898, announced that "two fine residences are being erected by Dr. H.K. Lum on the southeast corner of State and Ann." Lum lived here on and off until 1910. From 1910-1951, the O'Brien family resided here. Sara O'Brien was a well-known and beloved history teacher at the old Ann Arbor High School ("she taught history like a college professor"), a block away where North Quad is now. The house is a tour de force of late 19th century design, with varying types of windows, materials and shapes including a tower. It is in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District.

1722 Cambridge - David Burgoyne and Cynthia Brassert-Bowman

The Caroline Crocker house was built in 1904 in the Shingle Style so popular at the turn of the 20th century. Its gambrel roof, sleep eye dormer, original double-hung windows and original shutters all add to its charm, which has been kept in pristine condition by owners David Burgoyne and Cynthia Brassert-Bowman since 1996. Crocker's daughter Alice lived here until 1926 after which it became the Theta Phi Alpha sorority (1927-1932). Later the Director of the Bureau of Industrial Relations, Luther Purdom, lived here with wife Jemima.

500 Highland - John and Gretchen Jackson

This Colonial Revival style home was built and designed in 1921 by Wells Bennett, then an Associate Professor of Architecture at the University of Michigan who had been brought to Ann Arbor by Emil Lorch in 1912. It remained Bennett's home until 1953. In 1937, Bennett became the third leader of the architecture school after Lorch retired and the first to have the title of Dean (which he served as until 1957). Bennett's house is a modest home but there are others on Highland Road (carved out of the Andrew Franklin Smith fruit farm) that Wells designed in the 1920s, including 410 and 431. The current owners, John and Gretchen Jackson, have beautifully maintained the home since 1999.

518 Hiscock - Katie Belle St. Clair

This house was built between 1866 and 1869, as determined using bird's eye view and plat maps from those years. The footprint on the 1869 map matches the house as it stands today. It is a vernacular "upright and wing" form popular during the post-Civil War era, decorated with motifs influenced by the Greek Revival and Gothic Revival architectural styles. The house also features its original windows. An early 20th century one-car garage stands at the rear. The identity of the first family to occupy the house remains unknown, but members of the Knight family lived in the house from 1886 until after 1930. The St. Clair family has lived here since 1940. They have done a wonderful job in maintaining their home.

Centennial Awards

Centennial Awards are given to businesses and organizations which have been in Ann Arbor for at least 100 years.

Gargoyle Magazine - University of Michigan

In 2009 the Gargoyle Magazine celebrated a century of equal opportunity satire with two exhibits---one at the Harlan Hatcher Library entitled "Celebrating 100 Years of the Gargoyle" and one at the Bentley Library entitled "The Gargoyle Trawls the Depth for Humor: 100 Years of Cartoon and Quips at the University of Michigan." The exhibit featured the first cover from 1909 and had many examples of its scatological humor. The magazine was founded by future Detroit News Editor Lee A. White, and was the official humor magazine of the University and a branch of UM Student Publications which included the Michigan Daily and the Michiganensian.

Sesquicentennial Awards

Sesquicentennial Awards are given to businesses and organizations which have been in Ann Arbor for at least 150 years.

UM Men's Glee Club - University of Michigan

The Men's Glee Club was founded in 1859 and is one of the oldest collegiate choruses in the United States and the oldest continually run student organization on the Michigan campus. The group consists of graduate and undergraduate men chosen by audition at the beginning of the Fall and Winter terms. The group performs regularly in Michigan and tours a region of the US or goes abroad as well. The group recently celebrated this milestone with a reunion in April with a Banquet and Dinner Dance at the Michigan League.

Special Merit Awards

These are awarded to projects that focus on an unusual aspect of a historic property

Kempf House - 312 South Division - City of Ann Arbor

In 2009, the Kempf House Museum reported that the nine cast iron grilles in the eyebrow windows above the porch and sides of the house had been re-installed after being repaired and cleaned. The remaining damaged grilles were moved to the sides of the house. The Museum also oversaw the installation of a new handicap ramp on the north side of the house, replacing a 20-year old cement ramp on the south side that was failing. The removal of the old ramp has allowed more garden restoration. New bulbs have been planted and the heritage Saucer Magnolia is thriving with help from Michael Palmer of the Matthaei Botanical Gardens. Richard Mitchell, of Mitchell and Mouat architects, and city Parks Planner Amy Kuras also were involved in this project. The Kempf House Museum is a city-owned museum dedicated to interpreting the lives of Pauline and Reuben Kempf who were renowned music teachers and active in the German community. They purchased the house in 1890. The house was built for UM Secretary Henry DeWitt Bennett in 1853. It is in the Division Street Historic District.

Stockwell and Mosher Jordan Dormitories – University of Michigan

A special award was given to recognize the slate roof restoration and tuck-pointing done on these two iconic, formerly women's, dorms. Mosher Jordan was built in 1930 and Stockwell Hall in 1940. The renovation of these dorms is part of a \$40 million project which included infrastructure updates and a new dining hall. Restoring the slate roofs insured that the buildings would retain their Neo-Tudor style, and updates provide modern amenities for residents.

Mulholland Street - an intact early 20th century landscape

Mulholland Street was platted in 1916 and was originally known as Sixth Street. In 1928 it was re-named for the Mulholland farm, which had been subdivided to create both Murray and Mulholland Streets. Both streets have almost identical colonial revival houses and gently slope down a hill from Liberty to Washington. The original owners

had diverse occupations, including a jeweler, an Edison employee, a plumber, a pastry chef and a retired Army man. The houses on Mulholland, which keep a wonderful rhythm down the street with their identical porches and roof pitches, have been kept in immaculate condition by many long time owners, some of whom have lived there for decades. They are seen as quintessential Old West Side homes, and one of the loveliest walks in the neighborhood. The street is in the Old West Side Historic District.

Project of the Year

St. Andrew's Church - 306 N. Division

St. Andrew's Episcopal Church was formally organized in 1827 and first met in member's homes. By 1867, the congregation was able to hire pre-eminent architect Gordon Lloyd to design their Gothic Revival Church of native fieldstone, which stands proudly today at the corner of Division and Catherine. The church recently completed a two-year renovation project with the services of Quinn Evans Architects. They replaced the massive roof on the main church, the 1880 Chapel (Page Hall), and the 1930 Cloister with Vermont slate (keeping the old chevron patterns); repointed the stone work; restored the walnut and butternut pews; re-grouted and re-leaded the stained glass windows; refurbished the Pewabic floors; renovated the cupola and had a new finial made for the southeast corner of the Love Palmer Tower; and replaced the old horsehair pew cushions. The HDC applauds their commitment to their community and to the downtown. Quinn Evans received an Honor award from the American Institute of Architects in 2009 for the renovation of the church. It is in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District.

For More Information

If you would like more information about the Historic District Commission or its activities, please contact Jill Thacher, Historic Preservation Coordinator, at (734) 794-6265 x42608 or email jthacher@a2gov.org.