City of Ann Arbor Employees’ Retirement System & Retiree Health Care Benefit Plan & Trust (VEBA)

Update for City Council Working Session
March 23, 2020

James D. Anderson, FSA, EA, FCA, MAAA
Richard C. Koch, Jr., ASA, EA, MAAA
## Retirement System

### Active Members as of June 30, 2019
**Tabulated by Valuation Divisions**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Valuation Divisions</th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Annual Payroll</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General</td>
<td>382</td>
<td>$28,940,639</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Hybrid</td>
<td>131</td>
<td>7,435,857</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>11,296,685</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police Hybrid</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>132,406</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>7,340,329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire Hybrid</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>123,781</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Active Members</strong></td>
<td>711</td>
<td><strong>$55,269,697</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Hybrid Plan members have a benefit equal to ½ defined benefit and ½ defined contribution.

### Retirees and Beneficiaries as of June 30, 2019
**Tabulated by Valuation Divisions**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Valuation Divisions</th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Annual Allowances</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General</td>
<td>695</td>
<td>$19,517,836</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>10,678,478</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>7,572,234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>1081</td>
<td><strong>$37,768,548</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Inactive Members Eligible for Deferred Benefits as of June 30, 2019
**Tabulated by Valuation Divisions**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Valuation Divisions</th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Estimated Annual Allowances</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>$1,923,019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>164,090</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fire</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>46,422</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>149</td>
<td><strong>$2,133,531</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Financial Reporting for Retirement Plans

• Governmental Accounting Standards (GASB)
  ❖ Modified standards in the past 5 years to utilize estimated market values of liabilities and assets.
  ❖ Results are incorporated into the City’s financial statements.
  ❖ Annual valuations reflect the volatility of the financial markets on June 30th of each year.

• Actuarial Standards of Practice
  ❖ Govern funding valuations performed by an independent professional actuary.
  ❖ Used to determine the Actuarial Determined Contribution (ADC) by the City for subsequent years.
  ❖ Annual valuations reflect less volatility due to the use of rolling averages.
Funding Status – Accounting Standards

**FUNDING OF RETIREMENT PLANS**

The city contributes funds to retirement plans so that when an employee retires from providing services to the city, adequate funds are available to pay for their retirement benefit. A trust is utilized to invest all employer and employee contributions. When the value of the investments in the trust are less than the value of the cost of the benefits, the fund is less than 100% funded.

**PENSION**
The City has funded **86.1%** of current pension liability.

**HEALTH CARE**
The City has funded **63.5%** of its retiree health care liability.

How does this compare to the last 5 years?

- **PENSION**
  - 2014: 83%
  - 2015: 88%
  - 2016: 84%
  - 2017: 88%
  - 2018: 86%

- **HEALTH CARE**
  - 2014: 44%
  - 2015: 48%
  - 2016: 51%
  - 2017: 57%
  - 2018: 66%
So Why is an Actuary Here Tonight?

GRS mathematically combines People, Benefits, Assumptions & Asset information

To produce digestible information for decision-making by the Board and City

Demographic Information

Plan Provisions

Actuarial Valuation

Actuarial Assumptions

Financial Information

Employer Contributions

Funded Status

Unfunded Actuarial Accrued Liability

Funding Plan
Retirement Program Sustainability Equation

\[ C + I = B + E \]

**Benefits** depend on

- Plan Provisions
- Experience

**Contributions** depend on

- Short Term: Actuarial Assumptions & Cost Method
- Long Term: Investment Income, Benefits, Expenses
## Summary of Valuation Highlights - ERS and VEBA for the FYE June 30, 2019

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Employees’ Retirement System</th>
<th>Retiree Health Care Benefit Plan &amp; Trust (VEBA)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Actuarial Value of Assets</td>
<td>$ 513,611,000</td>
<td>$ 186,568,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Actuarial Accrued Liability</td>
<td>$ 601,109,000</td>
<td>$ 282,357,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unfunded Actuarial Accrued Liability</td>
<td>$ 87,498,000</td>
<td>$ 95,789,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FYE 2021 Estimated Contribution</td>
<td>$ 15,251,000</td>
<td>$ 16,878,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funded Ratio</td>
<td>85%</td>
<td>66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Projected Year to Attain 100% Funded Status</td>
<td>2039</td>
<td>2028</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
GRS Trendline: MI City/County Plans Retirement System Funded Status

Distribution of Funded Ratio (Actuarial Value of Assets)

This exhibit was generated using the following criteria: Valuation Date: 12/31/2018, 06/30/2019, 09/30/2019; Type of Employees: General, Public Safety, Other (Mixed); Amount of Assets: < $100 Million, $100 to $999.9 Million; Number of Members (Active and Retired): < 1,000, 1,000 to 49,999, 50,000 to 99,999, 100,000+; Group Status: Open, Closed; State: Michigan; Level of Government: City, County, Other.
© 2020 Gabriel, Roeder, Smith & Company. All rights reserved.
GRS Trendline: MI City/County Plans Assumed Investment Return

Distribution of Assumed Investment Returns

This exhibit was generated using the following criteria: Valuation Date: 12/31/2018, 06/30/2019, 09/30/2019; Type of Employees: General, Public Safety, Other (Mixed); Amount of Assets: < $100 Million, $100 to $999.9 Million; Number of Members (Active and Retired): < 1,000, 1,000 to 49,999, 50,000 to 99,999, 100,000+; Group Status: Open, Closed; State: Michigan; Level of Government: City, County, Other.

© 2020 Gabriel, Roeder, Smith & Company. All rights reserved.
Michigan VEBA Results (from PA 202\textsuperscript{1})

• Ann Arbor ahead of most cities in funding the obligation
  – Average Funded Percent = 43.1%
  – Median Funded Percent = 16.8%
  ○ Nearly 30% reporting have $0 assets

\textsuperscript{1} Source: MI Department of Treasury.
“Summary_Reporting_2019-11-12_671784_7.xlsx”
Risk Management

• Board Governance – Prudent Practices in Place
  – Perform an experience study every 5 years and review assumptions
  – Review funding policy contribution at least every 5 years:
    o Provides for contribution >= the Actuarially Determined Contribution
    o Provides for contribution stability
  – Declining amortization period until both plans reach 15 Years
  – Level dollar amortization unique for funding Public Sector Retirement benefits

• Actions taken to address liability growth/risk
  – Dual Plan approach provides new benefit tier for certain post-2016 hires for Retirement System
  – VEBA provides new benefit tier for all hired after 2011-2012 effective dates
• Will lead to ultimate contribution reduction and stability, relative to historical benefits
Investment Highlights

(Provided by Meketa – the System’s Investment Consultant)

• Very well diversified plans, structured to meet or exceed return assumption
• Highly effective private markets investment programs including private equity, private debt, and private real estate
• Low cost management structure - approximately half the median cost of other public funds of its size
• Recent investment in a Global Renewable Power Fund
QUESTIONS?