

City of Ann Arbor Climate Action Plan Task Force Meeting

Date: September 26, 2011

Location: Clean Energy Coalition Office

Note taker: Kristin Baja

Attendees: Terry Alexander, Wayne Appleyard, Bonnie Bona, Charles Hookham, Joe Malcoun, Laura Rubin, Nancy Stone, Mike Shriberg, Valerie Strassberg, Chris White

Facilitators: Jenny Oorbeck, Nate Geisler

Other Staff: Wendy Barrott, Rebecca Filbey, Allison Skinner, Matt Naud, Kristin Baja

Jenny Oorbeck- Communities Division Manager at CEC

CEC is partnering with the City of Ann Arbor to manage this process and create the Climate Action Plan

Other CEC Staff in attendance: Wendy Barrott- Miss PACE, Rebecca Filbey, Allison Skinner

Matt Naud- City of Ann Arbor Environmental Coordinator

This project is funded by a P2 grant from the State. Nate and Andrew helped get this project started and Nate is now the main contact person. The money for this grant came from interest on the bottle money- \$250,000 a year (+)

The point is to try and get together people who are already working on climate change in the area. It's been about ten years since the City has looked at this and we wanted to bring together a core group that will help find the marginal improvement goals and also the "go big or go home" goals.

In the City there is now four service areas rather than 16 departments. We are housed in the Systems Planning unit.

We are expecting this process to take place over nine months and require at least six meetings together between now and June 2012.

Introductions:

Name, organization, background, what you're currently working on related to climate change, what you might like to see incorporated into this plan

Joe Malcoun works with DTE energy in corporate strategy. Service for utility and non-utility businesses. Graduated from University of Michigan with SNRE/MBA . Matt hired Joe and Jenny 8 years ago as graduate students to create the original climate action document.

Valerie Strassberg is a member of the environmental commission and works with Natures Choice. She focuses on water energy programs and looking at water-energy connections. She wants to focus on how to manage water more sustainably. She's been working on storm water since 2010 and GHG related to storm water management. She is chair the water committee on the environmental commission and is also currently working on green infrastructure in streets

Terry Alexander is the Director of Campus Sustainability from operations perspective (2 yrs). He works with partners such as the Graham institute on projects such as living learning and attempts to get students involved. His other focus is long-term sustainability initiatives

Laura Rubin is the Director of the Huron River Watershed Council which covers 910 sq. miles. She is working on two main projects right now: 1) Raising awareness of energy used when using water and 2) Working with stakeholders within the watershed that manage stormwater and land. She has been working with NOAA to focus on downscaling at the watershed level and talk about best practices. She also sits on city of ann arbors greenbelt commission.

Mike Shriberg- Is currently working with the University of Michigan. He is on the City's Energy Commission. Prior to U of M he was involved with States Energy Standards and Policy, worked with ecology center. Scaling down to a community level is something he wants to work on with this project

Chuck Hookham- works with HDR. He practices internationally and also worked on local projects with Detroit Edison. He is on the energy commission, the intergovernmental panel for climate change, the institute of sustainable infrastructure and has done work with SCE sustainability institute. He is locally involved in all kinds of renewable energy- water, buildings, etc... and supports the great lakes commission

Jamie Kidwell is an Energy Associate with the City of Ann Arbor. She is currently working on a project to gather all of the City's goals and prioritize/arrange them. She is working with all four commissions tomorrow night and hopes to have a better idea of the outcome after that meeting

Chris White works with AATA and his biggest focus right now is trying to get people to ride buses. Ann Arbor will be the first city to have ½ hybrid buses but we need people to ride them. Opportunity with grants has likely passed and need to face tough choices to focus on service

Wayne Appleyard is a local architect that focuses on energy efficient architecture. He is the current chair of the Ann Arbor Energy Commission. He wants to focus on extreme energy conservation measures and sees this plan as a step in the right direction. He wants this to be more than a piece of paper

Steve Manville works for the Washtenaw County Health Department. He inspects companies with toxic materials of which there are many in the County. He can look at efficiency efforts with them. Outside of the county he has been involved with renewable energy and received a certificate

Bonnie Bona is an architect who has been in the community for over 20 years. She is an employee of the CEC but here as a member of the City Planning Division. Currently she is working on better buildings for Michigan and creating new home performance packages. Additionally, the Exceed Energy Project will help create the first renewable energy panels at Michigan theatre (?). From the planning commission she met with energy commission 1 1/2 yrs ago to define sustainability. This project is a way to be accountable. We're missing the meat right now. Wants to put numbers to things

Nancy Shore- Directs the *Get Downtown* Program that is a partnership between the City of Ann Arbor, the Downtown Development Authority and AATA. The program helps downtown employees look at commuting habits. Right now they are working on a program called "Conquer the cold" which attempts to get downtown employees to continue best practices in the winter months. She does a lot of interfacing with individuals and has some data on downtown employers commuting behavior. Her background is in social work

Nate Geisler is the Energy Programs Associate in City of Ann Arbor. He has been with the city for two years and is really involved in grants for energy related projects. He will be the main point person for the City on this project. Has been involved with both planning and energy systems

Kristin Baja is SNRE and MUP student at the University of Michigan. She has been working as an intern with the City since June. Recent projects include putting together data for the Climate Action Task Force and gathering data for the Sustainability Framework with Jamie Kidwell and Matt Naud. Kristin also has worked on three climate adaptation plans for three other U.S. Cities for her masters project

Two group members not present: *Mike Garfield* from the Ecology Center and *John Koupal* on the Environmental Commission

PRESENTATION (SLIDES):

History

1981 Energy Plan established goals that are still relevant today and established the energy commission Update in 1994.

2003 student report on greenhouse gas reduction strategies is where we are starting from and revisiting ways to meet existing Energy Challenge goals and set new targets.

This group will convene monthly meetings through June of next year. Purpose is to identify measures to reach short-term 2015 goals but also identify mid-range goals (2030) and long-term goals (2050). Several communities have committed to 80% reeducation by 2050

We want this to be useable and focus on community-wide sectors since municipal emissions are 2% or less of the big picture.

ICLEI five milestone process reviewed:

<http://www.icleiusa.org/action-center/getting-started/iclei2019s-five-milestones-for-climate-protection>

Baseline data for greenhouse gas targets is year 2000 (from the 2003 SNRE student project)

Data

GHG Emissions Inventories

Purpose is to measure the amount of emissions in your city- tracking emissions needs to happen

Points when data isn't available and there is a lot of room for error

There are assumptions that have to be made

Challenges-

- 1) Precision of data, transportation data especially
- 2) Establishing boundaries
- 3) DTE data has been by zip code

Changes in vehicle types are accounted for somewhat in ICLEI's CACP software (that uses mpg changes)

When someone purchases a gallon of gas, it's not necessarily burnt here in Ann Arbor

Recession – how has it had an effect in Ann Arbor?

What communities are willing to put on their climate action plan?

Freeway transportation miles is something municipalities don't have direct control over, but freeway vehicle miles traveled (VMT) are a part of the Washtenaw Area Transportation Study's (WATS) calculations we are using for the greenhouse gas inventory.

Boundaries

City boundaries and the closed landfill owned by the city

Due to limitations, this plan and inventory will not be accounting for air travel/airport, transportation of materials to get to A2, point source emissions from industry, or generators

Protocol- ICLEI

Exist for both Community-wide and Municipal emissions. This task force is focused on Community-wide emissions with City and Energy Office making municipal strides and planning for what's necessary.

All emissions data based on GHG emissions

CO₂, CH₄, N₂O are all being used and translated into carbon dioxide equivalents

Discussion about U of M data:

Joe- Why not divide up the University power plant? The power plant provides power for other sectors- disperse it based on the sector it is serving

Bonnie- U of M is such a major component- why wouldn't it be its own separate category?

Wendy- currently this is just based on the DTE data

Terry- We have data but it's separated at what is generated at the power plant, natural gas generators,

Valerie- What does campus provide vs. what DTE provides?

Terry- Generation on campus is power plant, boilers, natural gas generators, all the electric we can cover on campus

Joe- Maybe we need to have a small effort on how to categorize the U of M. We did it as one category in the 2003 report (Malcoun was co-author).

Jenny- Does the University know the sq. footage of each building?

Terry- could put just make U of M a sector unto itself

Charles- Terry, for your initiatives, did you go back to 2000 data at all?

Terry- Baseline is 2006. 1995 data and then accounting in 2004 but it would be an effort to pull together 2000 data accurately (City has some estimates for this using the 2003 report and/or backcasting Office of Campus Sustainability data)

Matt- have we looked at zip code related data? I forget how they get cut but could it be by area?

Charles- I'm surprised that works too. Meters and billing cross borders. There is error

Joe- it's not at the system level

Matt- Southeast Michigan has one of the cheapest fleets on the planet. Fleet turnover is relatively slow Relative to other parts of the country Michigan has a cleaner fleet, in part with reasonable deals from automakers on newest models (i.e., employee discounts for general public)

Joe- did cash for clunkers have anything to do with that?

Matt- Placeholder-I can follow up with Environmental Commissioners John German and John Koupal on that

2000 and 2010 Greenhouse Gas Inventory

Jenny- Over 10 year time period not much of a change in emissions, no doubt resulting from economic changes in that time (DTE data from 2008 showed much higher use in some sectors like Industrial that has since fallen)

Matt- we have to report on that to the EPA- we'll make sure the estimates for that effort will fit into this one

Sector breakdown:

Not a lot of change. Most of the actions to date have been focused on municipal operations (< 2% of Ann Arbor emissions). The point of the group is to go beyond that and focus on the Community scale

GHG Scope (#s):

- 1 Emissions within the physical boundaries
- 2 Outside city boundaries (largely industrial)
- 3 Other indirect emissions

Valerie- Where is our electricity generated?

Joe- much of it comes from other states but a lot also comes from the Monroe power plant (coal). We do have fairly good marginal rates on our power but we don't purchase as much out of state as other areas. 80% coal

Building related emissions

What is the source of our electricity? Coal so it's much dirtier
Our average is 60% for coal which is higher than the national average

Mike- What do you know about the breakdown of industrial users?

Jenny- That's proprietary information that DTE won't share with us. We'd have to ask by industry which will take a lot of time and will be up to the city

Matt- 40% energy for University which is a more intense energy user based on labs and other intense uses

Valerie- it's very hard when we're looking at activity based uses. Transportation is an activity based use but the other two are general uses without an activity connection.

Wendy- There would be a lot of assumptions with that since we'd be guessing on heating, cooling, lighting.

Valerie- I'd like to see the data go further and see what types of activities are within each of these categories. Does this include energy for waste water activities, treating water, streetlights, etc...

Has there been talk about street repair related to city activities?

Matt- we track fuel use pretty tightly for city vehicles but when we hire someone to repair a street, those are not city vehicles but maybe we need to start tracking them

John- that's the only way you'll get the GHG emissions

Joe- is there a tax code assigned to industrial?

Matt- yes, we can pull who they are

Wendy- we can get and torture ourselves with this data but the DTE data is pretty good

Transportation Emissions

Gasoline is primarily used city-wide

Emissions by Raw Fuel and Waste Source

Electricity is the largest source of emissions in the city. Gas is second. Natural Gas is third.

Terry- I do have a question on this. Our power plant – where is it on this graph? In natural gas pocket? Is it being double counted?

Wendy- kWh generated are subtracted out and thus not double counted

Terry- The University is using natural gas to create electricity and heat. Is that counted in electricity pocket or the natural gas pocket.

Nate- Right now it's in electricity pocket (general consensus says it should be in natural gas pocket)

Wayne- You're burning natural gas so it should be counted in natural gas

Mike- This mixes fuel and usage- that's why it's complicated

Charles- you're losing methane and we could double count there as well. We need to be careful and consistent

Chris- What is the source of data for watts and gasoline?

Mike- is there reasonable cost information added? Fuel switching becomes important

John- another way to check statewide fuel consumption numbers and then bring them down to Ann Arbor VMT numbers

Jenny- we will continue to refine the inventory data throughout the year. None of this is fixed and we can and will come back to it

Rebecca project outline

Monday mornings from 10am-12pm in October (week of the 24th) and November

There is a steering committee meeting weekly with Matt (City), Nate (City), Jenny (CEC), Rebecca (CEC), Wayne (Energy Commission), Wendy (PACE coordinator/CEC) and Kristin (City).

Shared Site

You should have received an email from Allison inviting you to join a google docs page. This is a place where information will be shared throughout this process.

The first time you access this folder you need to click the link through this email to accept the invitation.

If you already have a google based email account you can use it to log into this or create a separate account. The account you use to log in will be the one associated with this account from that point forward

It will bring you to a folder (you can choose the new look or the classic look)

In the folder will be power points from meetings, meeting notes, agendas, materials, etc...

There is also a contacts section, Michigan information, Ann Arbor information, GHG Emissions Inventories, and Climate Action Plan samples.

If you click on the checkbox next to the name of the file and then use the eye to get a preview of what is in the file

If you want to add anything to the folder please email it to Alison at CEC and she can upload it. Please add a description of what the PDF or document contains.

Chris- what if I want to share emails?

Nate- send them to me and cc Jenny and I will keep track of it

Matt- if you know of something some other city has done please let us know because we have connections to other planners in those cities.

We are going to be tracking how to build climate change adaptation and mitigation throughout this process. Recently the city adopted 12 metrics – two of them are:

1. To what extent does your project relate to the city's environmental goals
2. To what extent does this project reduce energy use or achieve energy goals

We will also provide you with Jamie Kidwell's Sustainability Framework project to give you a sense of the goals that have been blessed by the commission members from this joint commission meeting.

Chuck- I think our plan needs to extend beyond just the city. The County and the State should be a consideration in this process. We should set examples.

Jenny- The five cities doing plans are meant to provide examples for others, while staying within their boundaries for evaluating emissions.

Wendy- Michigan Action Climate Plan- part I and part II approaches. It talks about where to push on policy

Matt- I would like to add more homework regarding natural gas and electricity – how much of that is heating and cooling? We have the sq. footage numbers and can provide more data to this processes

Joe- we just partnered with OPower- they do energy efficiency stuff where they compare your energy usage to your neighbors. Maybe we can partner with them to drive residential demand down

Bonnie- Better buildings is already pulling information parcel by parcel with five utilities

Joe- I will follow up with what an OPower partnership might be? They have a really nice package that they send you from going online and taking a look at it

Homework for next time: If you're not familiar with a climate action plan please take a look on google docs at some of the sample plans we have posted. Where are some areas that you feel we could really focus on?

To do/Follow up on:

- Check up on U of M data and determine whether or not it could be separated out
- Attain zip codes + four energy data
- Follow up with Joe about the tariff change
- Matt – follow up with John German and John Koupal on cash for clunkers
- Industrial – how do we get more specific data for uses
- Identify activities within each category and how they use energy= more rich data
- Tracking non-city vehicles for construction projects and emissions from running those all day
- Verify how University of Michigan data is being counted from the power plant. The electricity pocket vs. the natural gas pocket.
- Fleet data- confirm it and create another chart to show breakdown
- State fuel sales
- Natural gas and electricity – how much of that is heating and cooling?
- Joe will follow up with OPower partnership options