



**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE REGULAR SESSION OF THE
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF ANN ARBOR
Thursday, December 11, 2008.**

Commissioners Present: Sarah Shotwell, Michael Bruner, Robert White & Ellen Ramsburgh (4)

Commissioners Absent: Diane Giannola. Jim Henrichs and Kristina Glusac (3)

Staff Present: Kristine Kidorf, Kidorf Preservation Consulting and Brenda Acquaviva, Administrative Support Specialist V, Planning and Development Services (2)

CALL TO ORDER: Commissioner Shotwell called the Regular Session to order at 7:01 p.m.

ROLL CALL: Quorum satisfied.

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA: The Agenda was approved without objection.

A - HEARINGS

A-1 HDC08-057 - 255 E. LIBERTY ST

A-2 HDC08-058 - 255 E. LIBERTY ST – MSHD (To be heard together)

BACKGROUND: This storefront occupies the eastern end of the Zwerdling Block, built in 1915 by tailor Osias Zwerdling. Zwerdling was a leader in the local Jewish community. In the late 1970s, the building and its neighbor to the east, the 1917 Darling Block, were renovated into the East Liberty Plaza. The six original storefronts were removed and new contemporary ones inset several feet to allow light into new commercial spaces in the basement level. All of the original wood double-hung windows were replaced with metal double-hung windows in the same size but with unequal sash.

The Commission approved the installation of three awnings in the western storefronts (for Yoshi's Restaurant) in August 2008.

LOCATION: North side of East Liberty Street, between South Fourth and Fifth Avenues.

APPLICATION: This report covers two applications seeking approval for the installation of several signs in and adjacent to the eastern front entryway of the building. The applicants are seeking HDC approval to install a projecting sign adjacent to the entry at the eastern end of the building, and three additional signs within the entryway on the front elevation. The purpose of the signs are to advertise the names of the tenants (including those in the basement).

STAFF FINDINGS:

1. The projecting sign consists of three parts: a scroll bracket, and two MDO boards hanging below the bracket. The overall dimension of the sign is 24" by 36" and ½" thick. It will be on the front wall at the east end of the building, adjacent to the main entryway. The bottom of the sign will be 8 feet above the sidewalk. The sign will not be illuminated.
2. Three additional signs are to be mounted around the entryway. The largest is 20" by 28" in dimension, and ½" thick. It will be hung within but near the top of the entryway, covering an exposed steel I-beam. The bottom of the sign will be greater than 8 feet above the

52 sidewalk. The other two signs are identical. The proposed dimensions are 54” by 36” by
53 ½.” One sign will be installed on the west wall of the entry way, at the top of the stairs
54 leading to the lower level. The other sign is to be installed on the east wall of the
55 entryway. None of the signs will be illuminated.

- 56
57 3. The proposed signs are generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture,
58 material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets
59 *The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation* in particular standard numbers
60 9 and 10.

61
62 **Owner/Address:** Liberty Plaza Associates, c/o Oxford Property Mgmt. 325 E. Eisenhower
63 Parkway, Ann Arbor, MI 48108

64
65 **Applicant #1:** Graphic Visions 16857 Northville Road, Northville, MI 48167

66
67 **Applicant #2:** DIY 3660 Plaza Drive, Suite 4, Ann Arbor, MI 48108

68
69 **Review Committee:** Commissioners Bruner and Shotwell visited the site.

70
71 Commissioner Bruner – We found things to be as outlined in the application and in staff’s report it
72 is something that I would support.

73
74 Commissioner Shotwell – Concurs with Commissioner Bruner and staff. It is appropriate for the
75 site and is also something that I would support.

76
77 **A-1 Applicant Presentation:** Laura Arbaugh, Bella Rose’ Boutique and Melissa Bryant, Organic
78 Bliss Boutique, retailers at this site, were present to speak on behalf of the appeal. They stated it
79 would help to have appropriate signage as they are located below grade and their customers
80 have a difficult time locating their businesses.

81
82 **A-2 - Applicant Presentation:** Mr. Chuck Reid, represents DIY and Oxford Management. He
83 stated that they tried to come up with signage that would be decorative and also provide
84 identifying signage.

85
86 **Questions of the Applicant by the Commission:** None.

87
88 **Audience Participation:** None.

89
90 **Discussion by the Commission:** None.

91
92 **MOTION #1 (HDC08-057)**

93
94 Moved by Commissioner White, Seconded by Commissioner Bruner, “**that the Commission**
95 **issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application at 255 East Liberty Street, in the**
96 **Main Street Historic District, to install a projecting bracket sign adjacent to the entryway at**
97 **the east end and front elevations, as proposed. The work is generally compatible in**
98 **exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building**
99 **and surrounding areas, and meets the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for***
100 ***Rehabilitation*, in particular, Standard Numbers 9 and 10.”**

101
102 Commissioner Ramsburgh - Suggests that this be amended to add stipulations on the bracket
103 installation.

104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154

AMENDMENT TO MOTION #1

Moved by Commissioner Ramsburgh, Seconded by Commissioner Shotwell, “to amend the original motion to add the following verbiage: *On the condition that the bracket is installed into the masonry joints of the building and not the bricks.*”

On a Voice Vote – MOTION TO AMEND ORIGINAL MOTION #1 - PASSED – UNANIMOUS

MOTION #1 AS AMENDED (HDC08-057)

Moved by Commissioner White, Seconded by Commissioner Bruner, “that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application at 255 East Liberty Street, in the Main Street Historic District, to install a projecting bracket sign adjacent to the entryway at the east end and front elevations, as proposed, *on the condition that the bracket is installed into the masonry joints of the building and not the bricks.* The work is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and surrounding areas, and meets the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation*, in particular, Standard Numbers 9 and 10.”

On a Voice Vote – MOTION #1 AS AMENDED - PASSED – UNANIMOUS (HDC08-057 Application Approved).

MOTION #2 (HDC08-058)

Moved by Commissioner White, Seconded by Commissioner Ramsburgh, “that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application at 255 East Liberty Street in the Main Street Historic District to install three signs mounted in the entryway at the eastern end of the front elevation, as proposed. The work is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation*, in particular standards 9, and 10.”

On a Voice Vote – MOTION TO APPROVE – PASSED – UNANIMOUS (HDC08-058 Application Approved).

A-3 315 EAST LIBERTY STREET - ELSHD

BACKGROUND: This two-story Queen Anne residential building was built in 1890 and was the home of grocer William F. Stimson. It features wood one-over-one windows with small colored squares of stained glass outlining the clear glass on many of the upper sashes. A 1 ½-story gable-roofed addition was added to the rear sometime in the early 20th century.

In 2004 and 2005, certificates of appropriateness were issued to alter the front façade, install a sidelight next to the front door, build a new front porch, and replace siding on the structure. In May 2008, a certificate of appropriateness was issued for a proposed two-story addition to the rear of the structure. This application seeks to modify that proposal.

LOCATION: The site is on the north side of East Liberty Street, between South Fifth Avenue and Division Street.

APPLICATION: The applicant seeks HDC approval to modify parts of the rear elevation: (1) to raise and enlarge the existing gable dormer; (2) to add a smaller cross-gable roof to the rear porch roof; (3) to move an existing door; and (4) to install three single sash windows. Other proposed changes to the existing structure were approved in May 2008 by the HDC, and include the removal of a double-hung window on the north (rear) elevation, and the replacement of two windows on the east elevation with egress windows.

STAFF FINDINGS:

1. Space that was formerly commercial has been converted to residential, and the owners are now trying to bring it up to City housing and building codes.
2. The rear of the house currently has a gable dormer that has been sided over with an artificial siding. The applicant proposes to expand the dormer in height and width but keeping the same roof pitch. The dormer will be sided in wood siding to match the rest of the rear elevation and will have an awning window near the center of the gable. A second awning window is proposed toward the right side of the gable at the level of the current eave line.
3. An existing double hung window at the second floor is proposed to be replaced with an awning type window matching the other two new windows. Although the window appears to be original it is not a character-defining feature. The window opening will be covered with wood siding to match. All three awning windows are proposed to provide light into the stair and meet stair code.
4. The rear of the house has a shed roofed porch that appears to be original but was raised at some point in the past. The applicant proposes to install a gable dormer above the existing staircase in order to provide adequate headroom at the back edge of the porch.
5. It is proposed to remove an existing non-original door opening on the rear porch; the area will be covered with matching wood siding.
6. Staff finds that this proposal is less invasive to the historic structure than the one approved in May 2008. Raising the gable dormer on the roof above the rear elevation does not impact the overall architectural character of the building. The installation of a cross-gable on the shed roof of the rear porch is appropriate as it is in keeping with the overall character of the house. Finally, the layout of single-sash windows on the rear elevation is similar to the one approved by the commission in May 2008.
7. The proposed work is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, & 10.

Owner/Address: Vahan Basmajian, 315 E Liberty Street, Ann Arbor, MI 48014

Applicant: Mike Van Goor, 118 N. Fourth Avenue, Suite 'A', Ann Arbor, MI 48104

Review Committee: Commissioners Bruner and Shotwell visited the site.

Commissioner - We found things to be as outlined in the application and in staff's report and I am in favor of this application.

Commissioner Shotwell – Concurs with Commissioner Bruner and staff. It is appropriate for the site and less intrusive than what was originally approved, and I will also support this application.

Applicant Presentation: Mr. Michael Van Goor, Van Goor Architects, was present to speak on behalf of the application. He stated that staff had outlined the nuts and bolts of the project well, and added some background as to why they wanted to make the proposed changes. Because the changes they wanted to make would require them to site plan this through the Planning Department, so they wish to make the changes interior in order to avoid that dilemma. He went out to give specifics about the changes.

Questions of the Applicant by the Commission:

Commissioner Ramsburgh – Is the part under the gable on the porch enclosed? (No, it's open, but the top of the dimension string shows the minimum headroom we need in order to comply with egress).

Audience Participation: None.

Discussion by the Commission:

MOTION

Moved by Commissioner White, Seconded by Commissioner Ramsburgh, “**that the Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the application at 315 East Liberty Street in the East Liberty Historic District to modify the rear elevation of the house to expand the gable roof, install new windows, replace an existing window, remove a door, and add a porch roof gable, as proposed. The work is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation*, in particular standards 2, 5, 9, and 10.**

On a Voice Vote – MOTION TO APPROVE - PASSED – UNANIMOUS (*Application Approved*)

B - OLD BUSINESS – None.

C - NEW BUSINESS –

C-1 Request for Approval of Historic Plaque at 124 East Washington Street in the Main Street Historic District.

BACKGROUND: This two-story vernacular commercial building was built on the site of a former house in 1906. It features one-over-one double-hung windows placed in an opening with a slight arch at the top, and a brick cornice with stone trim. The building was first briefly the home of Taylor and Co., a merchant tailor, and then was known as the Star Annex Theater (the Star Theater was located next door at 118 E. Washington). Beginning in 1918 until about 1973, the building housed a bakery. The first bakery was operated by members of the Carl R. White family, and was known as the White Bakery (1918-c.1945). The second bakery was called the DeLuxe Pastry Shop (c. 1947 to c. 1973). Its owners were Karl Volz and Gottfried Metzger.

LOCATION: Southwest corner of East Washington and South Fourth Ave., between South Fourth Avenue and Main Street.

APPLICATION: The applicant seeks HDC approval to install a historic building marker mounted on the wall commemorating the building.

259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310

STAFF FINDINGS:

- 1. The building is an early 20th century commercial storefront with two additional stories on top. The building has been well maintained and depicts a relatively high level of integrity.
- 2. The building is a significant contributing structure within the Main Street Historic District.

Owner/Applicant/Address: Herbert Black, Jr., 2411 Shannondale, Ann Arbor, MI 48014

Applicant Presentation: Mr. Herbert Black Jr., owner and applicant was present to speak on behalf of the request. He passed out further historic information regarding this home, and K. Kidorf suggested that he come into the office to discuss the building’s history and location of the plaque.

Commissioner’s Ramsburgh and White – Thanked the petitioner for keeping this building in very good condition.

MOTION

Moved by Commissioner White, Seconded by Commissioner Shotwell, "that the Commission approve a request for the installation of a plaque to commemorate the building at 124 East Washington Street in the Main Street Historic District."

On a Voice Vote – MOTION TO APPROVE - PASSED – UNANIMOUS (Application Approved)

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION – GENERAL (Limited to 3 Minutes per Speaker) – None.

D - APPROVAL OF MINUTES –

- D-1** Draft Minutes of the October 9, 2008 Special Session – (Corrections – Line 317, delete the word ‘and.’; Line 318 needs a comma behind the first word.
- D-2** Draft Minutes of the October 22, 2008 Regular Session – Approved as Presented
- D-3** Draft Minutes of the November 13th, 2008 Special Session – Approved as Presented.
- D-4** Postponed until the January 2009 Regular Session.

Hearing No Objections – The Minutes were accepted as amended and presented.

E - REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS – None.

F - ASSIGNMENTS

F-1 November 2008

- A-1 255 E. Liberty Street (HDC08-057) - Commissioner Bruner
- A-2 255 E. Liberty Street (HDC08-058) - Commissioner Bruner
- A-3 315 E. Liberty Street Commissioner White

Review Committee for January 2009 – Commissioners Ramsburgh and Bruner.

G - STAFF ACTIVITIES REPORT

G-1 November staff report was handed out to the Commission. K. Kidorf reported that here were a total of 16 applications; 6 of those were approved at the staff level, 8 were heard by the HDC. Ms. Kidorf also informed the Commission that they need to start thinking about items for the annual retreat, which should take place in either February or March.

Ms. Kidorf also informed the Commission that it becomes very difficult for staff to accommodate applicants who continually change their applications, and ask that the Commission not encourage that behavior. We are all attempting to make the application and hearing process a solid procedure that will accommodate the petitioner, but constant last minute changes are not to be encouraged.

H - CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS

Commissioner Ramsburgh – Concerns regarding Delta Epsilon fraternity (1331 Hill Street) in which the Commission had previously partially approved. It appears that the contractor had attempted to begin some demolition. Staff will put in a code enforcement issue in regard to this.

I - COMMUNICATIONS

K. Kidorf – Explained communications that the HDC had received regarding the new A2D2 changes.

Commissioner Ramsburgh – Stated that the HDC should be commenting on this proposal, as it greatly affects the Historic Districts.(K. Kidorf stated that Wendy Rampson would be available to meet with the HDC at 6:00 for a special session prior to the January 2009 regular session in order to address any concerns or questions the HDC might have).

ADJOURNMENT

The Meeting was adjourned at 7:50 p.m. without objection.

SUBMITTED BY: Brenda Acquaviva, Administrative Support Specialist V, Planning and Development Services.