



**APPROVED MINUTES OF THE REGULAR SESSION OF THE
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF ANN ARBOR
Thursday, August 14, 2008.**

Commissioners Present: Sarah Shotwell, Diane Giannola, Michael Bruner, Robert White, Jim Henrichs, Kristina Glusac and Ellen Ramsburgh (6)

Commissioners Absent: Michael Bruner (1)

Staff Present: Kristine Kidorf, Kidorf Preservation Consulting and Brenda Acquaviva, Administrative Support Specialist V, Planning and Development Services (2)

CALL TO ORDER: Commissioner White called the Regular Session to order at 7:05 p.m.

ROLL CALL: Quorum satisfied.

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA: The Agenda was approved without objection.

A - HEARINGS

A-1 241 East Liberty Street - MSHD

BACKGROUND: This storefront occupies the western end of the Zwerdling Block, built in 1915 by tailor Osias Zwerdling. Zwerdling was a leader in the local Jewish community. In the late 1970s, it and its neighbor to the east, the 1917 Darling Block, were renovated into the East Liberty Plaza. The six original storefronts were removed and new contemporary ones inset several feet to allow light into new commercial spaces in the basement level. All of the original wood double-hung windows were replaced with metal double-hung windows in the same size but with unequal sash. The brick of the Zwerdling Block, as well as its large wood cornice, was painted a darker buff color in an effort to unite it visually with the Darling Block.

LOCATION: North side of East Liberty Street, between Fourth & Fifth Avenues.

APPLICATION: The applicant is proposing to install a new acrylic horizontal sign in the signband of the building's front elevation and a triangular shaped awning over the all of the storefronts. The sign will be 6' 2" long and 1' 3" high with a light fixture running across the top.

STAFF FINDINGS:

1. The proposed sign will be 1' 3" tall and 6' 2" wide, it will project 2" from the wall because of the mounting brackets. At the top of the sign a row of fluorescent lamps will project 1' to shine light on the red and gold sign that read's "Yoshis."
2. The sign will fill the height of the signband above the windows. The placement of the sign is appropriate for the historic building and is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, standard numbers 9 and 10.
3. The proposed red fabric awning on a metal frame will project 2' from the building and will be 2' 6" tall and have an overall width of 50' to match the width of the building, covering multiple storefronts. The applicant is showing breaks in the center of the columns between the storefronts. Staff has asked the applicant to keep the awnings within each storefront masonry opening.

- 52 4. The bottom of the awning will be 10'10" above the sidewalk. It is unknown exactly where
53 the awning will be attached to the building, it appears to be below the signband and
54 overlap the sides.
55
- 56 5. Awnings typically cover only one storefront. The awning should be re-designed to fit within
57 the masonry opening at the top and sides. There should be a separate awning at each
58 storefront.
59
- 60 6. The proposed awning is not generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture,
61 material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and does not
62 meet *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* in particular standard
63 numbers 9 and 10.
64

65 **Owner/Address:** Oxford Property Mgmt., 325 E. Eisenhower Parkway, #310, A2, MI 48105

66
67 **Applicant/Address:** Apex Sign (Deborah Horvath, 6200 N. Dort Highway, Flint, MI 48505

68
69 **Review Committee:** Commissioners Glusac and White

70
71 Commissioner Glusac – Supports staff's findings to have separate awnings as opposed to one
72 continuous. I would like to ask the petitioner how they are going to attach this.

73
74 Commissioner White – Concurs with Commissioner Glusac and staff.
75

76 **Applicant Presentation:** No one was present to speak on behalf of the application.
77

78 **Questions of the Applicant by the Commission:**

79
80 Commissioner Ramsburgh – (To Commissioner Glusac) – If you're unsure about where the sign
81 will be attached, we should address it in the motion. (Agreed).
82

83 **Audience Participation:** None

84
85 **Discussion by the Commission:**

86
87 Commissioner Henrichs – Concurs with staff findings and the Review Committee.
88

89 **MOTION**

90
91 Moved by Commissioner Shotwell, Seconded by Commissioner Giannola, "that the
92 **Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the sign and light fixture as**
93 **proposed and for the awning provided the following conditions are met: 1) The awning is**
94 **redesigned to be in separate sections and is kept within the masonry opening of each**
95 **storefront; 2) the applicant submits a revised awning drawing meeting the above condition**
96 **for staff approval; and 3) All anchors attaching the sign and the awnings to the wall are**
97 **entered into the masonry joints and not into the brick face. Provided the above conditions**
98 **are met, the work is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material**
99 **and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The***
100 ***Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, in particular standard numbers 9**
101 **and 10."**
102

103 **On a Voice Vote – MOTION PASSED – UNANIMOUS (Application Approved)**

A-2 2781 Packard Street - Cobblestone Farm

BACKGROUND: The Ticknor-Campbell house is known as the Cobblestone Farm because of the unique construction technique of the cobblestone house on the property which was built by Dr. Benajah Ticknor in 1844. Built in the Classic Revival style, it is one of the finest of the few examples of cobblestone construction in Michigan. Together with the wooden kitchen ell in the rear, it forms an unusually fine example of a pioneer Michigan farm dwelling. There has been only one alteration to the exterior of the cobblestone house. During the Booth family tenure (1860-1880), an Italianate-style wooden front porch with bracketed columns was added to the front façade. The barn was constructed on the property in 1986 as part of the farmstead restoration after the property was acquired by the City in 1972.

LOCATION: North side of Packard Road, between Easy Street and Eisenhower Parkway on Ann Arbor's southeast side.

APPLICATION: The applicant is proposing to replace the existing two awnings on the east elevation of the barn with a single, permanent pent roof, and to beautify the landscape on the east side of the building. The proposed pent roof would be covered with wood shingles, and have vertical wood siding at the ends. The landscape proposed work includes the installation of a barrier-free walkway from the south parking lot to the entrance on the east elevation, additional lighting and plantings, and the installation of three benches.

STAFF FINDINGS:

1. The proposed scope of work impacts the barn in this historic district. The barn is of newer construction (1986) and does not contribute to the historic significance of the district. The Cobblestone Farm Association is in support of this application.
2. The proposed pent roof on the east elevation of the barn has been modeled after one depicted in Allen Noble's Wood, Brick and Stone: The North American Settlement Landscape : Barns and Farm Structures (1984).
3. The bottom of the roof will be 8' above grade, will be 3' 6" tall, 6' deep, and 18'8" long. It will be covered with sawn cedar shingles to match the barn roof. The ends will have vertical cedar channel siding to match the barn. There will be a semi-circular gutter along the edge of the roof.
4. The walkway will connect the parking lot area to the south of the barn (the side of the barn facing the historic house) with the main entry to the barn on its east side. The walkway is to be made of irregular paving blocks to mimic stone and will be barrier-free.
5. The proposed landscaping along the walkway includes the installation of aluminum bollards painted black and plantings.
6. Three wood & metal benches to be placed along the walk & adjacent to entry into the barn.
7. The proposed work is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* in particular standard numbers 9 and 10.

Owner/Address: Parks & Recreation, 2781 Packard Road, A2, MI 48104

Applicant: Amy Kuras, Parks and Recreation, 100 North Fifth Ave., A2, MI 48104

Review Committee: Commissioners Glusac and White visited the site.

Commissioner Glusac – Agrees with staff findings, and as staff mentioned, the barn was constructed in 1986, so that structure does not contribute. The replacement roof is compatible and appropriate as well as the landscape improvements. Looking at the plan drawing, I am concerned that the downspout should be positioned in such a way that it goes away from the concrete pad. This is a large roof and there will be large amounts of water from that.

Commissioner White – Concurs with Commissioner Glusac and staff.

Applicant Presentation: Amy Kuras, City of Ann Arbor Park Planner, was present to speak on behalf of the appeal. She stated that the only change from what was presented was that instead of concrete infill between the two pads, that area will mimic the cobblestone being installed elsewhere. Any downspout from the barn will be connected to the ‘rain garden,’ which has an underground connection.

Questions of the Applicant by the Commission: None.

Audience Participation: None

Discussion by the Commission:

Commissioner Henrichs – Concurs that this will be an improvement to the property.

MOTION

Moved by Commissioner Giannola, Seconded by Commissioner Ramsburgh, “**that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 2781 Packard Road in the Cobblestone Farm Historic District to construct a wood pent roof on the east elevation of the barn; and to install landscaping features, including a barrier-free walkway from the south parking lot to the entry on the east elevation, three benches, bollard light posts, and plantings, as proposed. The proposed work is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the historic district and meets *The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation*, in particular standard numbers 9 and 10.**”

On a Voice Vote – MOTION PASSED – UNANIMOUS (Application Approved)

A-3 205-207 East Washington Street - MSHD

BACKGROUND: The ca. 1895 Sudworth Building is a commercial brick structure three-stories tall and five bays wide. The center bay is relatively narrow, visually separating the identical east and west portions of the building. The relatively large window openings on the second and third floors exhibit round, Romanesque-style arches. Additional architectural features are decorative, and include stone trim highlighting window openings and floor levels, and brick corbelling at the cornice. In 1965 the first floor was renovated and its stone piers were covered with 2 x 2 ceramic tile, an aluminum-framed glass storefront, an 8’ cantilevered canopy, and enameled steel panels covering the masonry above the canopy. In 2007 the owners received HDC approval to modify the storefront.

The first commercial occupant of the building was the Allmendinger Music Store. Subsequent occupants included a grocery store and electric store. Historic photos from the early part of the 20th century reveal the presence of at least two different commercial signs on the front elevation that are no longer extant.

LOCATION: North side of East Washington Street bet. North Fourth Avenue & North Fifth Ave.

APPLICATION: The applicant is proposing to install a new vertical sign and two spotlights on the second level of the building's front elevation. The approximately 9 foot tall sign would be mounted at the center of the eastern half of the building. It will be made of aluminum and urethane foam.

STAFF FINDINGS:

- 1) The applicant proposes to install a projecting sign that is 9' 3" tall at the second floor of the building between two windows, one bay north of the center of the building. The proposed sign is 3' 7" wide and less than 24" thick. The outside edge of the sign is 4' from the building face.
- 2) The sign faces will be a combination of aluminum and urethane foam. Sections of the sign will be cut out with a plastic background that will be internally lit. The backlit sections include the lettering "Blue Tractor Brewery" and "BBQ" and the logo of the restaurant.
- 3) The sign will be fabricated so that mounting can occur through the existing masonry joints using 1/2" or 3/8" bolts.
- 4) A total of two directional spotlights will provide exterior lighting for the sign, one on either side, mounted to the wall of the building below the sign and shining upward. The light fixtures will be round, are detailed on the attachment, and painted to match the dark colors of the sign and will be mounted through the mortar joints.
- 5) Historically this building has had projecting signs that were metal with either neon or internal lighting through cut openings on the sign as seen in the historic photographs provided by the applicants. While a plastic faced-internally lit sign would not be appropriate for a historic building, a metal sign with cut-out openings, similar to historic metal signs is appropriate.
- 6) The proposed work is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, standard numbers 9 and 10.

Owner/Address: 205-207 E. Washington LLC, 205-207 E. Washington Street, A2, MI 48104

Applicant: Huron Sign Co. (attn.: Kevin Short), P.O. Box 980423, Ypsilanti, MI 48198

Review Committee: Commissioners Glusac and White visited the site.

Commissioner Glusac – Agrees with staff findings. It appears that the applicant has addressed the concerns of the anchorage through the mortar joint. The scale and location are appropriate.

Commissioner White – Concurs with Commissioner Glusac and staff.

Applicant Presentation: Kevin Short with Huron Sign Company was present to speak on behalf of the appeal. He stated that the owners also have a restaurant in Grand Rapids.

Questions of the Applicant by the Commission: None.

Audience Participation: None

Discussion by the Commission:

MOTION

Moved by Commissioner Ramsburgh, Seconded by Commissioner Shotwell, “**that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 205-207 East Washington Street in the Main Street Historic District to install a commercial sign and lighting as proposed. The proposed work is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation*, in particular standard numbers 9 and 10.”**

On a Voice Vote – MOTION PASSED – *UNANIMOUS (Application Approved)*

A-4 823 West Washington Street - OWSHD

BACKGROUND: This two-story frame house with clapboard siding has a front gabled roof, a small attic window above two windows centered in the second floor; a one-story front porch with hip roof, turned posts and lattice skirting. It also has a west facing side gable. The house has received a relatively large, two-story, gable-roofed addition to the rear (south), which has multiple gable-roofed projections on its east, south, and west elevations. The addition was approved by the Historic District Commission in June 2006. The house is first listed in the 1897 Polk directory (as 83 W. Washington) as the home of J. E. Clarke, an “action maker.”

The property features an original 1½-story side-gabled frame barn to the immediate rear (south) of the house. The barn has a full-width, one-story shed-roofed lean on its rear elevation and currently serves as a garage. A chicken coop formerly situated behind the barn/garage was removed in 2007 (approved by the Commission).

LOCATION: South side of Washington Street, between Seventh and Mulholland Streets.

APPLICATION: The applicant is proposing four landscaping projects affecting the rear and side yards of the property.

Proposal A. Construct a 20’ by 20’ deck of cedar and ipe (a Brazilian hardwood) on concrete footings surrounding an existing hot tub behind the barn/garage. The deck would be 14 inches above grade, have steps down to grade on its east side, and have an L-shaped bench added on its SE corner.

Proposal B. Install a wood plank walkway on concrete footings between the house and garage. The walkway dimensions are approximately 9 feet wide and 15 feet long. It would be constructed at grade. Two steps lead from the eastern side of the walkway near the rear steps of the house down to the yard. The walkway would be made of treated lumber and ipe decking matching that of the existing rear porch and stairway of the addition to the house.

311 Proposal C. Install a 25' long privacy fence behind the barn/garage along the property's western
312 boundary. The proposed fence is eight feet in total height, with the lower six feet being solid
313 tongue and groove boards, and the upper two feet consisting of an open lattice. The fence would
314 be supported by posts in concrete footings.

315
316 Proposal D. Install a fence and walkway on the eastern side of the house. The 15' fence would
317 be installed between the east elevation of the house at its most eastern extent, and the eastern
318 property boundary. This is approximately 60 feet back from the road. The fence would match the
319 one proposed above, but would only be 6' in height (including lattice). It is bisected by a
320 matching gate distinguished by a wooden arch above. A 42 inch wide flagstone walkway on a
321 sand base is proposed for approximately 65 feet along the east elevation of the house. The
322 walkway would extend from the front of the house through the gate to the rear of the house.

323 **STAFF FINDINGS:**

- 324 1. The property has a very deep rear yard and the proposed deck will be located behind the
325 existing barn/garage where the chicken coop was removed (shed on drawing). The deck
326 will be smaller than the footprint of the garage. The applicant proposes to affix the deck to
327 the foundation of the existing barn structure. The rear section of the barn next to the deck
328 is not original; it appears to have been added on in the 1940s.
- 329 2. The proposed wood walkway (B) will connect the house with the barn and matches the
330 width of the stairs. A step on the south side of the walkway will lead to the rear yard.
- 331 3. The proposed privacy fence (C) will be located between the hot tub deck and a row of
332 arborvitae that are near the property line. The draft historic district design guidelines call
333 for rear yard fences to be limited to six feet in height, however in this instance the grade
334 level of the rear yard to the west is at least three feet higher than this property. Since the
335 fence will appear less than six feet tall to the neighboring property an eight foot tall fence is
336 appropriate in this instance.
- 337 4. The flagstone walkway, fence and gate (D) are proposed for the east side of the house. A
338 six foot tall fence from the side of the house to the south property line is an appropriate
339 location for the fence as it is behind the front setback line of the house and is limited to six
340 feet in height.
- 341 5. The proposed work is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture,
342 material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets
343 *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, standard numbers 9 and 10.

344
345
346 **Owner/Address/Applicant:** John and Rachel Criso, 823 W Washington St. A2, MI 48103

347
348 **Review Committee:** Commissioners Glusac and White visited the site.

349
350 Commissioner Glusac – The application was appropriate. The only concern with the privacy
351 fence is the two foot panel at the top - if the neighbor had any comments about it, but I'm
352 generally in support of it.

353
354 Commissioner White – Concurs with Commissioner Glusac and staff.

355
356 **Applicant Presentation:** Mr. John Criso was present to speak on behalf of the appeal.

361 **Questions of the Applicant by the Commission:**

362

363 Commissioner Glusac – Asked if the neighbor had any reservations about the fence.
 364 (J. Criso – I can't say, as we've not addressed that directly. We've been generally talking about
 365 what we propose, and there hasn't been any opposition).

366

367 Commissioner Ramsburgh – The Arborvitae you've planted will be on the neighbor's side of the
 368 fence? (Yes). But those are on your property? (Yes. In three to five years the trees will push
 369 the fence out, so that will have to be removed at that time, but then the trees should be able to
 370 give enough coverage so that a privacy fence won't be necessary).

371

372 Commissioner Henrichs – Do we know if the fence is in compliance with the fence ordinance?
 373 (K. Kidorf – Yes, it is).

374

375 **Audience Participation:** None

376

377 **Discussion by the Commission:**

378

379 **MOTION**

380

381 Moved by Commissioner Giannola, Seconded by Commissioner Henrichs, "that the
 382 **Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 823 W.**
 383 **Washington Street in the Old West Side Historic District to construct a 20' by 20' deck and**
 384 **install landscaping features, including two fences, a gate and walkways as proposed. The**
 385 **proposed work is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material**
 386 **and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The***
 387 ***Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, in particular standards 9 and 10."**

388

389 **On a Voice Vote – MOTION PASSED – *UNANIMOUS (Application Approved)***

390

391

392 **A-5 519 Fourth Street - OWSHD**

393

394 **BACKGROUND:** This simple 1½ story vernacular house with a two-story rear addition first
 395 appears in the 1915 Polk directory as the home of Adolph (a carpenter) and Hazel Seitz. There
 396 were three additional sets of occupants between then and 1921 (David and Regina Laubengayer
 397 in 1916; John F. and C. Lydia Hagen in 1917; and Clyde and Amelia J Tessmer from 1918 to
 398 1920), when Godfrey G. and Magdalene/Lena Cook occupied the house. Godfrey was a janitor
 399 and later a stock keeper for Mayer-Schairer Co., and he occupied the house until 1947 or 1948.
 400 The rear, two-story addition was approved by the Historic District Commission and built in 2007.

401

402 **LOCATION:** East side of Fourth Street, south of Jefferson and north of Madison.

403

404 **APPLICATION:** The applicant is proposing to add a wood landing and stairs in front of existing
 405 French doors on the east (rear) side of the 2007 addition.

406

407 **STAFF FINDINGS:**

408

- 409 1. The proposed staircase has already been constructed as the owner thought it would be
 410 approved by staff. It is attached to the rear elevation of the newer (2007) rear addition to
 411 the house. The rear elevation is a non-character-defining elevation.

2. The Commission noted in the Certificate of Appropriateness that the applicant should come back for review and approval for a rear stair or porch.
3. The proposed landing is 3' by 7.5' with 6 steps down. The steps will be 76" wide.
4. The proposed landing and stair are treated wood that will be stained, are simple in design and are generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* in particular standards number 9 and 10.

Owner/Address: Rob Silbergleit & Catherine Zudak, 519 Fourth Street, A2, MI 48104

Applicant: Bill Levleit, Westside Builders, 2200 Dexter, A2, MI 48103

Review Committee: Commissioners Glusac and White visited the site.

Commissioner Glusac – Staff mentioned and it is unfortunate that we are looking at this after the fact, but fortunately the work is appropriate, so I'm in support of the project.

Commissioner White – Concurs with Commissioner Glusac and staff.

Applicant Presentation: Bill Levleit, of Westside Builders was present to speak on behalf of the appeal. *(When asked by Commissioner Ramsburgh why he had not had the work pre-approved, he stated that he was told that stairs could be approved administratively, so we built them. There is an exact duplicate of this on Crest Street that was also approved).*

Questions of the Applicant by the Commission:

Audience Participation: None

Discussion by the Commission:

MOTION

Moved by Commissioner Shotwell, Seconded by Commissioner Giannola, **“that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 519 Fourth Street in the Old West Side Historic District to construct an external 3' by 7.5' landing and staircase at the rear of a newer 2-story addition, as proposed. The proposed work is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, in particular standards number 9 and 10.”**

On a Voice Vote – MOTION PASSED – UNANIMOUS (Application Approved)

A-6 1300 Broadway Street - BHD

BACKGROUND: This property includes a two-story duplex constructed in 2006. The drive and parking area are located to the west and southwest of the building. The drive leads to another duplex located on the next lot to the south. This is a non-contributing property in the newly designated Broadway Historic District.

LOCATION: South side of Broadway Street, near the intersection with Jones Drive.

APPLICATION: The applicant is proposing to install a new storage unit to the rear of the building (between the building facing the road at 1300 and the building to the rear (indicated as “1288” on the attached drawing). The free-standing storage unit is 9.6’ by 16.2’ in size. It will be wood framed and sided with vertical wood siding.

STAFF FINDINGS:

1. This is a non-contributing property in the newly established Broadway Historic District. There are two nearly identical structures on the property, 1300, a side-gabled, two story, vinyl sided apartment building which faces Broadway with a similar setback to the neighboring houses and 1288, which is set behind the first building and is perpendicular to the street. A gravel drive and parking lot accesses the entire property on the south side.
2. The proposed 9’ by 16’ shed is partially constructed. A building permit was mistakenly issued without historic review. A stop work order was issued at the request of staff until there is a certificate of appropriateness issued.
3. The one-story shed will sit on a 5” thick concrete slab and is directly behind the 1300 building on the property.
4. The building is 9’ tall in the front, and the roof slopes to 7’ tall in the rear. The single-slope roof will be covered with asphalt shingles. The sides of the building will be covered with OSB siding and painted.
5. The only opening proposed is a double door on the front (south) end of the building. The door opening will be 4’ wide and have exterior hinges.
6. Because the property is non-contributing, the shed is small in size compared to the two larger buildings on the lot, and is not obtrusive in the district, the proposed work is generally compatible with the surrounding historic district and meets *The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation*.

Owner/Address/Applicant: Jin Huang & Yong Yi Wu, 2096 Autumn Hill Drive, A2, MI 48103

Review Committee: Commissioners Glusac and White visited the site.

Commissioner Glusac – Supports staff findings, but feels it is again unfortunate that there was misinformation given to the applicant. The scale and location of the shed are appropriate. I would suggest that it should be covered in the same vinyl siding as the home.

Commissioner White – Concurs with Commissioner Glusac and staff.

Applicant Presentation:

The applicant representative stated that they were not aware that this was a Historic District until they received a stop work order. They stated that they would match the materials used on the home of that on the shed.

Questions of the Applicant by the Commission:

Commissioner Ramsburgh asked the petitioner if they could resolve what type of material the shed would be covered with vinyl siding instead of OSB. The representative stated that they would cover it in vinyl siding to match the home.

Audience Participation: None

Discussion by the Commission:

MOTION

Moved by Commissioner Shotwell, Seconded by Commissioner Giannola, “**that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 1300 Broadway Street, a non-contributing property in the Broadway Historic District, to construct a 9’ by 16’ storage shed with the condition that the siding applied to the shed matches the siding that is currently installed on the house. The proposed work is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation* in particular standard numbers 9 and 10.**”

On a Voice Vote – MOTION PASSED – *UNANIMOUS (Application Approved)*

A-7 510 West Liberty Street - OWSHD

BACKGROUND: This structure, Harris Hall, features classic Romanesque details: brick, stone banding, round-arched windows delineated by heavy stone tops, and a rough-cut fieldstone bay. Though the building’s original use was for Episcopal student gatherings, it was a local home for the USO in 1942, and the UM band used it for a time beginning in the late 1940s. The advertising firm of Buckheim & Rowland bought the building in the 1980s and during their ownership, Harris Hall was listed on the National Register of Historic Places.

LOCATION: North side of East Huron Street, between Division and State Streets.

APPLICATION: The applicant is proposing to modify a non-original sash and security screen to accommodate a window air conditioner.

STAFF FINDINGS:

1. The window sash and security screen that are proposed to be modified are not original and do not contribute to the historic character of the building. The location of the air conditioner would not damage or obscure historic features.
2. Several other basement windows on this building have window air conditioning units similar to what is proposed (see photo at right).

Owner/Address: Lynn Hilken, 523 West Liberty Street, A2, MI 48103

Applicant: Frederick H. Herrmann, Architect, 3172 Cardinal, A2, MI 48108

Review Committee: Commissioners Glusac and White visited the site.

562 Commissioner Glusac – I support staff findings since it has been explained that the bay is existing
563 to the home. I think it is more appropriate to keep the double-hung style windows in the bay as
564 opposed to the casement windows.

565
566 Commissioner White – Concurs with Commissioner Glusac and staff.
567

568 **Applicant Presentation:** Bonnie Bona, Architect on the project, was present to speak on behalf
569 of the owner. She stated that once they removed a portion of the siding, it was evident that there
570 was a previous window that existed that was taller. Both the windows from the interior look
571 identical to the original windows. I suspect they might be salvage windows, as there are no other
572 windows in the house of that size. She added that the divided lights that were requested were
573 the owner's attempt at differentiating the new work from the old.
574

575 **Questions of the Applicant by the Commission:**

576
577 Commissioner Glusac – Stated that she was on the original review committee on this project back
578 in January of 2008, and they toured the inside of the house, and she recalls that there was
579 something particular about the interior window trim. They thought that the width of it or something
580 similar led us to believe that those might be original. (B. Bona – Stated that coincidentally, the
581 smaller, narrower window on the other side of the bay has no trim at all on it).
582

583 **Audience Participation:** None
584

585 **Discussion by the Commission:**

586
587 Commissioner Ramsburgh – Commended the applicant for the work being done on the home,
588 and asked some questions regarding the handrails.
589

590 Commissioner Glusac – You stated that the windows are being changed in size and height; will
591 the head be consistent – increasing down to the floor or?? (B. Bona – The proposed head is at
592 the height of the windows in the original house which are just above 7 feet. The window near that
593 is 6'8" The house does have 9 foot ceilings).
594

595 **MOTION**

596
597 Moved by Commissioner Glusac, Seconded by Commissioner Henrichs, "that the Commission
598 issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the revised application at 510 West Liberty
599 Street in the Old West Side Historic District to replace the non-original west window in the
600 bay with a larger double-hung window, and to substitute a double-hung window for the
601 proposed new casement window in the north side of the bay on the condition that both
602 windows are one-over-one double-hungs with no divided lights. The work would then be
603 generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to
604 the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior's*
605 *Standards for Rehabilitation* in particular standards 2, 9, and 10."
606

607 **On a Voice Vote – MOTION PASSED – UNANIMOUS (Application Approved)**
608

609 **A-8 518 Lawrence Street - OFWHD**

610
611 **BACKGROUND:** The single dwelling at this address is a two-story house with a rectangular
612 footprint and a medium-pitch, flared hip roof. The house is two bays wide, and three bays deep.
613 It has a full-width front porch with hip roof and square columns. (cont.)

614 Above the porch is a projecting bay window that extends up to the third level and is capped by a
615 matching hip roof with flared eaves. An off-set one-story enclosed porch is attached to the rear of
616 the house. It has a flat roof with railing, serving as a deck accessed from the second story. The
617 lower level and foundation of the house are covered with stucco. The upper level is sided with
618 clapboard. The roof with relatively deep eaves is covered with asphalt.

619
620 Additional Craftsman-era detailing include single and paired 3/1 double hung windows. The
621 basement level has multiple awning-style windows on the side and rear elevations.

622
623 The Craftsman architectural style suggests that the house was built in the late 19th or early 20th
624 century. It does not appear on the 1880 bird's eye view map. Mrs. Emma B. Fogarty, who
625 owned millinery on Main Street, lived there as early as 1894 (when its address was 12 Lawrence
626 St.) until after 1930. She had at least one tenant living with her at various times.

627
628 **LOCATION:** The building is located on the south side of Lawrence Street, between Division and
629 State Streets.

630
631 **APPLICATION:** The applicant is proposing to install two new egress windows at the basement
632 level on the south (rear) and west (side) elevations of the building. The work would require
633 enlarging the vertical component of the existing window openings to accommodate the proposed
634 windows. The new windows would replace existing non-original windows. The larger openings
635 require the installation of window wells. The wells would be hidden by the addition of a grate,
636 fencing and/or plantings. The windows along the east elevation (driveway side) would remain.

637
638 **STAFF FINDINGS:**

- 639
- 640 1. The applicant proposes to replace two non-original basement windows with new wood
641 casement windows and install an exterior window well that is less than two-feet deep and
642 will not require a railing around the well in order to comply with sleeping room
643 requirements.
 - 644
 - 645 2. The windows are not character-defining features to the property. One window is near the
646 rear of the west side elevation, the other is on the rear elevation.
 - 647
 - 648 3. The west-side window well would cut into a narrow concrete walkway leading from the
649 front of the house to the rear. The walkway is no longer in use and in deteriorated
650 condition.
 - 651
 - 652 4. There are three existing window wells on the east elevation.
 - 653
 - 654 5. The proposed windows are 36" tall, however the majority of the window will be below
655 grade level, the window will appear to be approximately the same height of the existing
656 basement windows.
 - 657
 - 658 6. The proposed windows are wood casement windows.
 - 659
 - 660 7. The proposed work is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture,
661 material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets
662 *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* in particular standard numbers
663 2, 5, 9, and 10.
 - 664

665 **Owner/Address/Applicant:** Jane Belanger, BH707L, LLC, 2112 Vinewood Blvd., A2, MI 48104

666 **Review Committee:** Commissioners Glusac and White visited the site.

667

668 Commissioner Glusac – Agrees with staff findings, as stated, these are not ‘special’ windows and
669 do not contribute in any way. The only problem is that the walkway will be compromised on the
670 west side of the house and would like to know what their plans are to accommodate that
671 walkway. Generally, I’m in support of the project.

672

673 Commissioner White – Concurs with Commissioner Glusac and staff.

674

675 **Applicant Presentation:** Jane Belanger, owner, was present to speak on behalf of the
676 application. She addressed Commissioner Glusac’s concern regarding the walkway, stating that
677 they will jut it out around that window and save it if possible, but they want to make sure that the
678 safety for the tenants and the egress window exit are paramount. She stated that the tenants
679 don’t transit through that area at the back of the lot; there is a gate going to a back porch, but they
680 say that they mainly traverse the parking area and that it’s used as a backyard. If we closed it off
681 for safety reasons, they would not be disappointed. We can do plantings or a fence area to the
682 outside of that area.

683

684 **Questions of the Applicant by the Commission:** None.

685

686 **Audience Participation:** None

687

688 **Discussion by the Commission:**

689

690 **MOTION**

691

692 Moved by Commissioner Ramsburgh, Seconded by Commissioner Shotwell, “**that the**
693 **Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 518**
694 **Lawrence Street in the Old Fourth Ward Historic District to enlarge two basement-**
695 **level window openings to accommodate new egress windows as proposed. The**
696 **proposed work is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture,**
697 **material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and**
698 **meets *The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation* in particular**
699 **standards numbered 2, 5, 9, and 10.”**

700

701 **On a Voice Vote – MOTION PASSED – *UNANIMOUS (Application Approved)***

702

703

704 **A-9 207 South Fourth Avenue – MSHD**

705

706 **BACKGROUND:**

707

708 This storefront is the southernmost bay of four facing South Fourth Avenue that occupy the first
709 level of the Ypsi-Ann Building. The seven story building is situated at the southeast corner of
710 East Washington and South Fourth Streets. The commercial brick building was constructed in
711 1928. The first floor of the structure is distinguished from the rest by the use of stone rather than
712 brick. Early occupants at the 207 address include EJ Claire and Sons radio and Household
713 Appliance Shop (1928-1932), and the Automobile Club of Michigan (including AAA and the
714 Detroit Auto Insurance Exchange; (1934-1954). The latter also occupied the adjacent storefront
715 to the north (205 S. Fourth Ave.)

716

717 **LOCATION:** East side of South Fourth Avenue, between Washington and Liberty Streets.

APPLICATION: The applicant is proposing to install a new hanging “flagpole” sign that will be centered in the masonry pier on the left side of the storefront. The bottom of the sign will hang 9’ above the sidewalk. The sign will be mounted to a metal triangular frame.

STAFF FINDINGS:

1. The proposed sign is 2’ by 2’ in size and will project from the signband area of the storefront. It is not proposed to be illuminated and is compatible with the size of the building and the storefront.
2. A flat sign has been mounted in the signband, it is not clear whether this is temporary or not. There does not appear to be any record of approval for the flat sign, although it is appropriate in size and location for the historic building.
3. If the sign is mounted through the masonry joints, the proposed sign is generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation* in particular standard number 9.

Owner/Address/Applicant: Tamara & Kent Fowler, 14568 Brookside Drive, Belleville, MI 48111

Review Committee: Commissioners Glusac and White visited the site.

Commissioner Glusac – In support of staff findings; the only case is that the mortar joints weren’t the typical 3/8 of an inch, but more like 1/4 of an inch, so in order for the signage anchorage to be a clean attachment, it won’t be completely within the mortar joint. The applicant doesn’t seem to address the anchorage in their application, so we want to be sure to address that in the motion.

Commissioner White – Concurs with Commissioner Glusac and staff.

Applicant Presentation: Tamara Fowler, applicant, was present to speak on behalf of the application. She stated that the current sign on the building is only temporary – it’s cardboard. As to the bracket and hardware, she was unsure of the size but will make certain that the contractor adheres to what the Commission suggests. There was a previous awning on the building, which was removed by the owner of the building.

Questions of the Applicant by the Commission: None.

Audience Participation: None

Discussion by the Commission

:

MOTION

Moved by Commissioner Shotwell, Seconded by Commissioner Giannola, “**that the Commission issue a certificate of appropriateness for the application at 207 Fourth Avenue in the Main Street Historic District to install a 2’ by 2’ flagpole sign provided that the sign is mounted through the masonry joints. The work would then be generally compatible in exterior design, arrangement, texture, material and relationship to the rest of the building and the surrounding area and meets *The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation*, standard number 9.**”

On a Voice Vote – MOTION PASSED – UNANIMOUS (Application Approved)

770 **B - OLD BUSINESS – None**

771

772 **C - NEW BUSINESS –**

773

774 **C-1 Historic Design Guidelines – Review of final draft for recommendations to**
775 **City Council**

776

777 K. Kidorf – Reiterated that the Guidelines had been sent previously to the Commission for review.
778 The HDC needs to make a motion and approve these so that they can be moved forward for City
779 Council consideration so that they can ultimately come back to the Commission for approval.
780 Commissioner Ramsburgh has provided some minor language corrections which I will
781 incorporate but those are grammar based and shouldn't change the context.

782

783 Commissioner White – Asked that Commissioner Shotwell's name be added as "Secretary" in this
784 publication.

785

786 *(General discussion by the Commission on how 'consolidation' relating to mention of the Districts*
787 *within Districts could be handled).*

788

789 K. Kidorf – Stated that that would take a study committee and a new city council vote to do.

790

791 Commissioner Henrichs – Stated that the districts previously had different ordinances and rules,
792 and even though we've made one ordinance to deal with those, those still maintain their names –
793 It might derail the entire situation to broach that. I don't think that this is worth pursuing.

794

795 **MOTION**

796

797 Moved by Commissioner Henrichs, Seconded by Commissioner Glusac, **"that the HDC Approve**
798 **the Draft Historic District Designs, dated June 6th, 2008 and that this draft be forwarded to**
799 **the Ann Arbor City Council for review and approval."**

800

801 **On a Voice Vote – MOTION PASSED – UNANIMOUS (Draft will be sent to City Council)**

802

803

804 **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION – GENERAL – None.**

805

806 **D - APPROVAL OF MINUTES –**

807

808 **D-1 – Minutes of the May 2008 Regular Session were not available.**

809 **D-2 – Minutes of the July 2008 Regular Session were not available.**

810

811

812 **E - REPORTS FROM COMMISSIONERS – None.**

813

814 **F - ASSIGNMENTS**

815

816 **F-1 Monitoring assignments for approvals from the July 2008 Session:**

817

818 **A-1** 241 E. Liberty Street Henrichs

819 **A-2** 2781 Packard Road Ramsburgh

820 **A-3** 205-208 E. Washington Giannola

821 **A-4** 823 W. Washington White

822			
823	A-5	519 Fourth Street	<i>UNNECESSARY</i>
824	A-6	1300 Broadway	Ramsburgh
825	A-7	510 West Liberty	Glusac
826	A-8	518 Lawrence	White
827	A-9	207 S. Fourth Avenue	Shotwell

828
829 Review Committee for September – White and Ramsburgh

830
831 **G - STAFF ACTIVITIES REPORT**

832
833 **G-1** July reports were handed out by K. Kidorf and monitoring reports. There were 14
834 total applications in July 2008; 13 were approved – 7 went to the HDC, 6 were approved at the
835 staff level.

836
837 **G-2** Elections – Nominating Committee

838
839 K. Kidorf stated that the Nominating Committee will be making its choices for the upcoming
840 elections in October. She mentioned that Commissioner White has served the maximum two
841 years as Chair, so cannot continue in that particular role; Commissioner Bruner’s second term
842 ends in January of 2009, so he is ineligible for election as well.. She urged the Commission to
843 think about their options.

844
845 She also announced that on September 6, Washtenaw County is sponsoring a Workshop from 10
846 a.m. until 12 p.m. – near Washtenaw at US 23. This training is a modified version of our
847 Commissioner training and geared toward homeowners. Ms. Kidorf will be the featured
848 speaker. She invited homeowners, the public and the Commission to attend the free workshop.

849
850 **H - CONCERNS OF COMMISSIONERS**

851
852 Commissioner Ramsburgh – Stated that she thinks that the collaboration between the City and
853 county are very positive and productive.

854
855 On a different subject, she stated that she wanted to make the Commission and the public aware
856 of the possible demolition of the Fifth Avenue homes. She stated that she and Commissioner
857 Bruner have had conversation with a resident who in interested in having a Study Committee
858 formed to look at the historic significance of the properties in the are of Fourth and Fifth Streets
859 between William and Packard. *(She stated that this resident is in the process of writing a letter to*
860 *the Mayor to this effect).*

861
862 **I - COMMUNICATIONS** - Passed out in Packet – Invitation to Ohio Historic Commission
863 events and dinner.

864
865 K. Kidorf stated that in today’s mail, we received a “Proposal for Decision” for the Appeal that was
866 filed in conjunction with a denial at a previous HDC meeting. The State Historic Preservation
867 Review Board meets on September 12, 2008, so we will have more information after that time.

868
869 **ADJOURNMENT** - *The Meeting was adjourned at 8:35 p.m. without objection.*

870
871 **SUBMITTED BY: B. Acquaviva, Administrative Service Specialist V, Planning and**
872 **Development Services.**